

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Katherine Belcher

DOCKET NO.: 23-00941.001-R-2 through 23-00941.002-R-2

PARCEL NO.: See Below

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Katherine Belcher, the appellant, by attorney Robert Rosenfeld, of Robert H. Rosenfeld & Associates, LLC in Northbrook; and the Lake County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Lake** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

DOCKET NO	PARCEL NUMBER	LAND	IMPRVMT	TOTAL
23-00941.001-R-2	16-03-108-006	408,167	349,985	\$758,152
23-00941.002-R-2	16-03-108-029	197,575	0	\$197,575

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

## **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Lake County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2023 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

## **Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of two parcels with one being improved with a 2-story dwelling of wood siding exterior construction with 4,850 square feet of living area.<sup>1</sup> The dwelling was built in 1936 and is 87 years old with an effective age of 1981 or 42 years old. Features of the home include a basement, central air conditioning and three fireplaces. The subject also has a guest house with 1,180 square feet of living area, a 1,080 square foot attached garage and a 725 square foot detached garage that were built in 1940. The property has approximately 153,252<sup>2</sup> square feet of land area and is located in Lake Forest, Moraine Township, Lake County.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Additional descriptive details of the subject property not reported by the appellant were also drawn from the subject's property record card.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The property record card for the improved parcel (16-03-108-006) indicated a total site size of 112,445 square feet of land area (96,543 sq. ft. Imp R1 land + 15,902 sq. ft. of excess land). The board of review further indicated the unimproved parcel (16-03-108-029) has a site size of 40,807 square feet of land area.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted information on three comparable sales located within .31 of a mile from the subject and within the same assessment neighborhood code as the subject. The comparables have sites ranging in size from 38,280 to 42,270 square feet of land area and are improved with 2-story dwellings of Dryvit, brick, or stucco exterior construction ranging in size from 3,841 to 6,404 square feet of living area. The dwellings are 50 to 103 years old and have basements with one having finished area. Each home has central air conditioning and one or three fireplaces. Two comparables each have a garage with either 475 or 782 square feet of building area. The comparables sold from March to June 2022 for prices ranging from \$1,255,000 to \$1,800,000 or from \$271.17 to \$326.74 per square foot of living area, including land. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment.

The appellant also submitted the Notice of Findings by the Lake County Board of Review for both parcels disclosing a total assessment of \$955,727. The subject's combined assessments reflect a market value of \$2,867,468 or \$475.53 per square foot of combined living area, land included, when using the statutory level of assessment.<sup>3</sup>

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" on the improved parcel, parcel number 16-03-108-006.

The board of review submitted a copy of the subject's current Multiple Listing Service (MLS) that disclosed the subject parcel number 16-03-108-006 was listed on March 18, 2024 for \$2,895,000. The listing remarks noted the subject has a newly renovated kitchen in 2023 and the adjacent 1- acre parcel is offered for sale for an additional \$1,000,000. The board of review noted appellant's comparable sale #2 was on the market 514 days and provided the Listing and Property History Report. The board of review also provided an exterior photograph taken from the MLS of appellant's comparable sale #3 and noted the house is divided in two sections with no direct interior access to the main living area.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on four comparable sales located from .09 of a mile to 1.37 miles from the subject, one of which is located within the same assessment neighborhood code as the subject. The comparables have sites ranging in size from 45,302 to 108,029 square feet of land area and are improved with 1.75-story or 2-story dwellings of brick exterior construction ranging in size from 4,556 to 5,660 square feet of living area. The dwellings are 69 to 133 years old and have basements, with two having finished area. Three comparables have central air conditioning. Each comparable has one to four fireplaces. Comparables #1 and #2 each have garages with 396 and 970 square feet of building area, respectively. Comparable #3 has an 835 square foot attached garage and a 576 square foot detached garage. Comparables #3 and #4 have greenhouses. The comparables sold from January 2022 to May 2023 for prices ranging from \$2,075,000 to \$2,750,000 or from \$450.30 to \$510.58 per square foot of living area, including land. The board of review also

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Procedural rule Sec. 1910.50(c)(1) provides that in all counties other than Cook, the three-year county wide assessment level as certified by the Department of Revenue will be considered. 86 Ill.Admin.Code Sec. 1910.50(c)(1). Prior to the drafting of this decision, the Department of Revenue has yet to publish figures for tax

submitted a map displaying the location of the subject in relation to the board of review comparable sales and noted these sales are located within the Lake Forest School District and within the subject's market area. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested the subject's assessment be confirmed.

## **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The record contains seven comparables sales for the Board's consideration. The Board gives less weight to board of review comparables #2, #3 and #4 which are located less proximate to the subject and within a different assessment neighborhood code than the subject.

The Board finds the best evidence of the subject's market value to the appellant's comparables and board of review comparable #1 which are located more proximate to the subject and within the same assessment neighborhood code as the subject. However, the subject has a significantly larger site than these comparables. In addition, the subject property is composed of two parcels, one of which is an unimproved lot which none of the comparables have an additional lot. The comparables also have significantly smaller garages, if any when compared to the subject. Three of the four comparables also have significantly less living area than the subject, suggesting significant upward adjustments are necessary to make them more equivalent to the subject. Conversely, two comparables have finished basement area unlike the subject, suggesting downward adjustments are necessary to make them more equivalent to the subject. The comparables sold from March 2022 to May 2023 for prices ranging from \$1,300,000 to \$2,100,000 or from \$271.17 to \$460.93 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$2,867,468 or \$475.53 per square foot of living area, including land, which falls above the range established by the best comparable sales in this record. The Board finds, however, the subject's higher estimated market value is justified when considering the subject's larger site (additional lot), total living area which includes a guest house, and features. In addition, the record indicates that both of the subject's parcels were listed for sale in March 2024 for a total list price of \$3,895,000 (\$2,895,000 plus \$1,000,000) which is significantly higher than the subject's estimated market value reflected by the assessments of both parcels. This lends further support that the subject is not overvalued. Based on this evidence and after considering adjustments to the best comparable sales for differences when compared to the subject, the Board finds the subject's estimated market value as reflected by its assessment is supported and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

2	1. Fem
- <del>-</del>	Chairman
a R	assert Staffer
Member	Member
Dan Dikini	Sarah Bokley
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	

## **CERTIFICATION**

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:	November 19, 2024		
	Middl 214		
	Clark of the Property Town Append		

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

## **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

## PARTIES OF RECORD

## **AGENCY**

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

## **APPELLANT**

Katherine Belcher, by attorney: Robert Rosenfeld Robert H. Rosenfeld & Associates, LLC 40 Skokie Blvd Suite 150 Northbrook, IL 60062

## **COUNTY**

Lake County Board of Review Lake County Courthouse 18 North County Street, 7th Floor Waukegan, IL 60085