

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Illinois Realty Group Holdings LLC

DOCKET NO.: 22-04034.001-R-1

PARCEL NO.: 13-2-21-15-18-301-009

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Illinois Realty Group Holdings LLC, the appellant, by Thomas Benedick, Attorney at Law in O'Fallon; and the Madison County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Madison** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$8,470 **IMPR.:** \$63,000 **TOTAL:** \$71,470

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

# **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a notice of equalization issued by the Madison County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2022 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

#### **Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a 2-story dwelling of frame exterior construction with 1,832 square feet of living area. <sup>1</sup> The dwelling was constructed in 2005. Features of the home include a partial basement, central air conditioning, and a 620 square foot garage. The property has an 8,750 square foot site and is located in Collinsville, Collinsville Township, Madison County.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted information on three comparable sales which are reported to be located from 1.8 to 4.2 miles from the subject. The parcels range in size from 6,000 to 11,587 square feet of land area and are improved with 1-story or 2-story homes of frame exterior construction ranging

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The parties differ regarding the subject's dwelling size. The Board finds the best evidence of dwelling size is found in the subject's property record card presented by the board of review which contains a sketch with measurements and was not refuted by the appellant in written rebuttal.

in size from 672 to 1,100 square feet of living area. The dwellings were built from 1938 to 1960. Each home has central air conditioning. The comparables sold from April 2022 to February 2023 for prices ranging from \$50,000 to \$56,000 or from \$45.45 to \$83.33 per square foot of living area, including land. The listing sheet for comparable #3 presented by the appellant described this sale as part of a multi-property sale transaction. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total equalized assessment for the subject of \$71,470. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$214,431 or \$117.05 per square foot of living area, land included, when applying the statutory level of assessment of 33.33%. The board of review indicated in its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" that the appellant did not file a complaint with the board of review, but filed this appeal directly to the Board following receipt of a notice of an equalization factor of 1.0617 for Collinsville Township which increased the subject's total assessment from \$67,150 to \$71,470.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on three comparable sales located within 0.13 of a mile from the subject. The comparables are improved with 2-story or part 1-story and part 2-story homes of frame exterior construction ranging in size from 1,738 to 2,304 square feet of living area. The dwellings were built in 2005 or 2006 and feature a basement, one of which has finished area, central air conditioning, and a 378 or a 630 square foot garage. One home has a fireplace. The comparables sold from August 2020 to October 2022 for prices ranging from \$210,000 to \$235,000 or from \$102.00 to \$126.58 per square foot of living area, including land. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

#### **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

As an initial matter, the record indicates that the appellant did not file a complaint with the board of review but appealed the subject's total assessment directly to the Board based on notices of an equalization factor. Since the appeal was filed after notification of an equalization factor, the amount of relief that the Board can grant is limited. Section 1910.60(a) of the rules of the Board states in part:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Sec. 1910.50(c)(1) of the Board's procedural rules provides that in all counties other than Cook, the three-year county wide assessment level as certified by the Department of Revenue will be considered. 86 Ill. Admin. Code §1910.50(c)(1). As of the development of this Final Administrative decision, the Department of Revenue has not published figures for tax year 2022.

If the taxpayer or owner of property files a petition within 30 days after the postmark date of the written notice of the application of final, adopted township equalization factors, the relief the Property Tax Appeal Board may grant is limited to the amount of the increase caused by the application of the township equalization factor. (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.60(a)).

Additionally, section 16-180 of the Property Tax Code provides in pertinent part:

Where no complaint has been made to the board of review of the county where the property is located and the appeal is based solely on the effect of an equalization factor assigned to all property or to a class of property by the board of review, the Property Tax Appeal Board may not grant a reduction in the assessment greater than the amount that was added as the result of the equalization factor. (35 ILCS 200/16-180).

These provisions mean that where a taxpayer files an appeal directly to the Board after notice of application of an equalization factor, the Board cannot grant an assessment reduction greater than the amount of increase caused by the equalization factor. Villa Retirement Apartments, Inc. v. Property Tax Appeal Bd., 302 Ill. App. 3d 745, 753, 706 N.E. 2d 76, 82, 235 Ill. Dec. 816, 822 (4th Dist. 1999). Thus, any reduction would be limited to the increase in the assessment caused by the application of the equalization factor.

The record contains a total of six comparable sales for the Board's consideration. The Board gives less weight to the appellant's comparables, which are located more than one mile from the subject. Moreover, the appellant's #3 sold as part of a multi-property transaction. The Board gives less weight to the board of review's comparable #2, which sold less proximate in time to the assessment date than the other comparables in this record.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the board of review's comparables #1 and #3, which sold more proximate in time to the assessment date and are similar to the subject in age, location, and some features, but have varying degrees of similarity to the subject in dwelling size, suggesting adjustments to these comparables would be needed to make them more equivalent to the subject. These two comparables sold for prices of \$210,000 and \$235,000 or \$106.28 and \$102.00 per square foot of living area, including land, respectively. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$214,431 or \$117.05 per square foot of living area, including land, which is bracketed by the best comparable sales in terms of total market value, but is above the best comparables on a price per square foot basis, which appears to be logical given the subject is a smaller home than the best comparables. Based on this evidence and after considering appropriate adjustments to the best comparables for differences from the subject, the Board finds a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

21. Fer	
Ch	airman
a de la companya della companya dell	Solat Steffen
Member	Member
Dan Dikini	Swah Bokley
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	

# **CERTIFICATION**

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:	February 20, 2024
	Middle
	Challe of the Decreate Terr Annual Decret

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

#### **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

# PARTIES OF RECORD

# **AGENCY**

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

# **APPELLANT**

Illinois Realty Group Holdings LLC, by attorney: Thomas Benedick Attorney at Law 1004 South Lincoln Avenue Suite 12 O'Fallon, IL 62269

# **COUNTY**

Madison County Board of Review Madison County Admin. Bldg. 157 North Main St., Suite 222 Edwardsville, IL 62025