

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT:	Thomas Mattero
DOCKET NO.:	22-01489.001-R-1
PARCEL NO .:	16-15-316-014

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Thomas Mattero, the appellant, by attorney Ronald Kingsley, of Lake County Real Estate Tax Appeal, LLC in Hawthorn Woods; and the Lake County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds <u>No Change</u> in the assessment of the property as established by the Lake County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND:	\$49,711
IMPR.:	\$103,035
TOTAL:	\$152,746

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

#### **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Lake County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2022 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

#### **Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a tri-level dwelling of brick exterior construction with 1,772 square feet of above grade living area. The dwelling was constructed in 1960 and has an effective age of 1970. Features of the home include a lower level with finished area, central air conditioning, one fireplace and a 440 square foot garage. The property has an approximately 10,900 square foot site and is located in Highland Park, Moraine Township, Lake County.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted information on three comparable sales located within 0.81 of a mile from the subject and in the same neighborhood code as the subject property. The comparables have sites that range in size from 13,094 to 23,331 square feet of land area and are reportedly improved

with one-story dwellings<sup>1</sup> ranging in size from 1,779 to 1,973 square feet of above grade living area. The dwellings were built from 1957 to 1963 with comparable #1 having an effective age of 1966. Comparable #1 has a lower level with finished area<sup>2</sup> and two comparables are reported to have no basement or lower level. Each comparable has a garage with two having 440 or 483 square feet of building area. Two dwellings have central air conditioning, and one home has a fireplace. The properties sold from April 2020 to March 2022 for prices ranging from \$410,000 to \$478,500 or from \$230.47 to \$258.29 per square foot of above grade living area, land included.

The appellant submitted a copy of the Multiple Listing Service sheet associated with its comparable #1 which disclosed the property was updated in 2013. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested the subject's total assessment be reduced to \$140,565 which reflects a market value of \$421,737 or \$238.00 per square foot of above grade living area, land included, when applying the statutory level of assessment of 33.33%.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$152,746. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$458,284 or \$258.63 per square foot of above grade living area, land included, when using the statutory level of assessment of 33.33%.<sup>3</sup>

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on four comparable sales located from 0.60 of a mile to 1.24 miles from the subject property. The comparables have sites that range in size from 11,650 to 21,950 square feet of land area and are improved with tri-level or split-level dwellings of brick or brick and wood siding exterior construction ranging in size from 1,540 to 1,975 square feet of above grade living area. The homes were built from 1955 to 1957 and have effective ages ranging from 1955 to 1977. Two comparables have a lower level with finished area, one of which also has a finished basement, and two comparables have a crawl space foundation. Each dwelling has central air conditioning and a garage ranging in size from 308 to 598 square feet of building area. One home has two fireplaces. The properties sold from April to December 2021 for prices ranging from \$478,000 to \$601,000 or from \$293.67 to \$330.33 per square foot of above grade above grade living area, land included. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested the subject's assessment be confirmed.

## **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The subject's neighborhood is described as Highlands Splits. The appellant comparables are located in the same neighborhood code as the subject, suggesting these dwellings are multi-level in style.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Some property details for appellant comparable #1 were found in its Multiple Listing Service sheet submitted by the appellant.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Procedural rule Sec. 1910.50(c)(1) provides that in all counties other than Cook, the three-year county wide assessment level as certified by the Department of Revenue will be considered. 86 Ill.Admin.Code Sec. 1910.50(c)(1). As of the development of this Final Administrative Decision, the Department of Revenue has not published figures for tax year 2022.

value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales, or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The parties submitted seven comparable sales for the Board's consideration. The Board gives less weight to appellant comparable #1 which sold in 2020, less proximate to the January 1, 2022 assessment date than other properties in the record. The Board gives less weight to board of review comparable #1 which is located greater than one mile from the subject property.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be appellant comparables #2 and #3 along with board of review comparables #2, #3 and #4 which sold proximate to the assessment date at issue are more similar to the subject in location, age/effective age, design and dwelling size, but have varying degrees of similarity to the subject in foundation type, suggesting adjustments are needed to make these properties more equivalent to the subject. These comparables sold from March 2021 to March 2022 for prices ranging from \$475,000 to \$601,000 or from \$242.52 to \$310.39 per square foot of above grade living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$458,284 or \$258.63 per square foot of above grade living area, including land, which falls below the range established by the best comparable sales in this record on an overall market value basis and within the range on a per square foot basis. After considering appropriate adjustments to the best comparables for differences from the subject, the Board finds the subject's assessment is justified and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

Chairman Member Member Member Member **DISSENTING:** 

## CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:

March 26, 2024

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

## **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND</u> <u>EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

# PARTIES OF RECORD

# AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

## APPELLANT

Thomas Mattero, by attorney: Ronald Kingsley Lake County Real Estate Tax Appeal, LLC 40 Landover Parkway Suite 3 Hawthorn Woods, IL 60047

## COUNTY

Lake County Board of Review Lake County Courthouse 18 North County Street, 7th Floor Waukegan, IL 60085