

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Steven Bonneau
DOCKET NO.: 21-49608.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 13-13-130-013-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Steven Bonneau, the appellant, by attorney Anthony Lewis, of the Law Offices of Gary H. Smith in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$9,000 **IMPR.:** \$48,576 **TOTAL:** \$57,576

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2021 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a 1.5-story dwelling of brick and vinyl siding exterior construction with 1,587 square feet of living area. The dwelling is approximately 102 years old with an effective age of 25 years. Features of the home include a basement with finished area, central air conditioning, and a two-car garage. The property has a 3,760 square foot site and is located in Chicago, Jefferson Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-03 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted an appraisal estimating the subject property had a market value of \$460,000 as of January 1, 2021. The appraisal was prepared by James Ingraffia, an associate real estate

¹ The Board finds the best description of the subject is found in the appraisal submitted by the appellant, which contains photographs and a detailed property sketch with measurements.

trainee appraiser and George Stamas, a certified general residential real estate appraiser. The purpose of the appraisal was to determine the market value of the subject property for an ad valorem tax appeal.

In estimating the market value of the subject property, the appraisers developed the sales comparison approach by examining three comparable sales within .61 of a mile of the subject. The comparables are improved with dwellings ranging in size from 1,188 to 1,931 square feet of living area. The dwellings are 95 to 114 years old. Each comparable has a basement with two having finished area and a two-car garage. Two comparables have central air conditioning. The parcels contain either 3,750 or 4,725 square feet of land area. Two comparables sold in February and July 2020, with comparable #2 having a reported sale date of "059/04/2020." The comparables sold for prices ranging from \$391,000 to \$492,000 or from \$254.79 to \$329.12 per square foot of living area, including land. Adjustments were applied for differences between the comparables and the subject property for location, quality, condition, dwelling size, bathroom count, and other features to arrive at adjusted prices ranging from \$448,950 to \$497,750. Based on this data, the appraiser arrived at a market value of \$460,000 or \$289.86 per square foot of living area, including land, as of January 1, 2021.

Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the assessment to reflect the appraised value.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$57,576. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$575,760 or \$362.80 per square foot of living area, land included, when applying the 10% level of assessment under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on four comparables located within .25 of a mile of the subject and within the subject's assessment neighborhood. The comparables consist of one-story class 2-03 dwellings of masonry or frame and masonry exterior construction ranging in size from 1,364 to 1,562 square feet of living area. The dwellings are 101 to 103 years old. Each dwelling has a full basement, one of which has finished area. One comparable has a fireplace and three comparables each have either a one-car or two-car garage. The parcels range in size from 3,750 to 5,343 square feet of land area. The comparables sold from May 2020 to June 2021 for prices ranging from \$575,000 to \$880,000 or from \$417.21 to \$563.38 per square foot of living area, including land. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill. Admin. Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales, or construction costs. 86 Ill. Admin. Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The appellant submitted an appraisal and the board of review submitted four comparable sales to support their respective positions before the Property Tax Appeal Board. The Board gives less weight to the value conclusion in the appraisal; although the appraisers state that the appraisal comparables are the most recent sales of similar properties, the board of review presented sales of similar properties that were close in proximity to the subject and not considered by the appraisers. The Board will instead examine the raw sales in the record.

The Board gives less weight to appraisal comparables #2 and #3, which differ from the subject in dwelling size. The Board also gives reduced weight to board of review comparable #2, which lacks a garage, a feature of the subject.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be appraisal comparable #1 and board of review comparables #1, #3, and #4, which are similar to the subject in age, location, dwelling size, and some features. These most similar comparables sold for prices ranging from \$440,000 to \$880,000 or from \$317.92 to \$563.38 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$575,760 or \$362.80 per square foot of living area, including land, which falls within the range of the best comparable sales in this record. Based on this evidence and after considering adjustments to the best comparables for differences when compared to the subject, the Board finds a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified based on overvaluation.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

2	1. her
	Chairman
C. R.	Robert Stoffen
Member	Member
Dan De Kinin	
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:	February 18, 2025
	111:10 16
	Man O

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Steven Bonneau, by attorney: Anthony Lewis Law Offices of Gary H. Smith 640 N. La Salle Drive Suite 495 Chicago, IL 60654

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review County Building, Room 601 118 North Clark Street Chicago, IL 60602