

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Ray Marchica
DOCKET NO.: 21-26429.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 02-08-404-002-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Ray Marchica, the appellant, by attorney Brian P. Liston, of the Law Offices of Liston & Tsantilis, P.C. in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds <u>A Reduction</u> in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$12,388 **IMPR.:** \$94,612 **TOTAL:** \$107,000

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2021 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a 68-year-old, two-story, single-family dwelling of frame construction with 8,328 square feet of living area. Features of the home include a crawl space, central air conditioning, a fireplace and a four-car garage. The property has an 82,590 square foot site and is located in Inverness, Palatine Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-09 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted information on three equity comparables with varying degrees of similarities to the subject. Based on this evidence, the appellant is requesting an assessment amount of \$106,519.

However, the subject property was the subject matter of an appeal before the Property Tax Appeal Board the prior year under Docket Number 2020-21132.001-R-1. In that appeal, prior to a hearing, the appellant reached a settlement with the board of review and stipulated to a total assessment amount of \$107,000. Upon receipt of the stipulation, the Property Tax Appeal Board issued a decision lowering the assessment of the subject property to \$107,000 on the evidence submitted by the parties. The tax years 2020 and 2021 are within the same general assessment period and the appellant disclosed that the subject property is an owner-occupied residence.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$126,976. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$114,588 or \$13.76 per square foot of living area. In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on four equity comparables, all located within the same subarea and neighborhood code as the subject property.

Conclusion of Law

This Board finds section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code to be controlling and requires the subject's reduced assessment from 2020 remain in effect for 2021. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that the assessment as established by the Board for the 2020 tax year should be carried forward to the tax year at issue subject only to equalization as provided by section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code.

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-185) states in part:

If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel on which a residence occupied by the owner is situated, such reduced assessment, subject to equalization, *shall* remain in effect for the remainder of the general assessment period as provided in Sections 9-215 through 9-225, unless that parcel is subsequently sold in an arm's length transaction establishing a fair cash value for the parcel that is different from the fair cash value on which the Board's assessment is based, or unless the decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board is reversed or modified upon review. (Emphasis added)

The record disclosed the Property Tax Appeal Board issued a decision reducing the subject's assessment for the 2020 tax year. The record further indicates that the subject property is an owner-occupied dwelling and that 2020 and 2021 are within the same general assessment period. The record contains no evidence indicating the subject property sold in an arm's length transaction after the Board's decision or that the decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board has been reversed or modified upon review. For these reasons the Property Tax Appeal Board finds that a further reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

However, were this Board to consider the appellant's assessment inequity argument, it would still fail under the clear and convincing burden of proof. The Illinois Constitution requires that real estate taxes, "be levied uniformly by valuation ascertained as the General Assembly shall provide by law." Ill. Const. art. IX, §4 (1970); Walsh v. Property Tax Appeal Board, 181 Ill. 2d 228, 234 (1998). This uniformity provision of the Illinois Constitution does not require absolute

equality in taxation, however, and it is sufficient if the taxing authority achieves a reasonable degree of uniformity. Peacock v. Property Tax Appeal Board, 339 Ill. App. 3d 1060, 1070 (4th Dist. 2003).

When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e); Walsh, 181 Ill. 2d at 234 (1998). Clear and convincing evidence means more than a preponderance of the evidence, but it does not need to approach the degree of proof needed for a conviction of a crime. Bazyldo v. Volant, 164 Ill. 2d 207, 213 (1995). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The Board finds the best evidence of assessment equity to be the appellant's comparables #1 and #2 and the board of review's comparable #3. These comparables ranged in improvement assessment of \$10.46 to \$14.85 per square foot of living area. The subject's improvement assessment of \$13.76 per square foot of living area falls within the range established by the best comparables in this record. After considering the differences between the suggested comparables and the subject, the Board finds the subject's improvement assessment is supported. Based on this record the Board finds the appellant did not demonstrate with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement was inequitably assessed and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

21. Fer	
	Chairman
a de R	Robert Stoffen
Member	Member
Dan De Kinin	Swan Bokley
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:	November 19, 2024
	Middle 1/5

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Ray Marchica, by attorney: Brian P. Liston Law Offices of Liston & Tsantilis, P.C. 200 S. Wacker Drive Suite 820 Chicago, IL 60606

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review County Building, Room 601 118 North Clark Street Chicago, IL 60602