

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Abdul Malaki
DOCKET NO.: 21-07244.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 08-19-305-003

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Abdul Malaki, the appellant, by Jessica Hill-Magiera, Attorney at Law in Lake Zurich; and the DuPage County Board of Review.<sup>1</sup>

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **DuPage** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$108,840 **IMPR.:** \$320,670 **TOTAL:** \$429,510

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

# **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the DuPage County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2021 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

# **Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a 2-story dwelling of brick exterior construction with 4,979 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 2007. Features of the home include a basement, central air conditioning, four fireplaces, and a 586 square foot garage. The property has an 8,522 square foot site and is located in Naperville, Lisle Township, DuPage County.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted information on nine comparable sales located within the same assessment neighborhood code as the subject and within .79 of a mile from the subject. These comparables are described as 2-story dwellings built from 2004 to 2011 that range in size from 4,572 to 5,297 square feet of living area. The comparables each have a basement, five of which have finished

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The parties agreed to waive the scheduled hearing on this case and have the Board issue a decision based on the evidence in the record.

area. Each comparable has a garage with 668 to 882 square feet of building area. The comparables sold from March 2020 to October 2021 for prices ranging from \$785,000 to \$1,180,000 or from \$170.43 to \$244.97 per square foot of living area, land included. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's total assessment.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$429,510. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$1,284,804 or \$258.04 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2021 three-year average median level of assessment for DuPage County of 33.43% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In response to the appellant's evidence, the board of review submitted a grid analysis of the appellant's comparables that disclosed all have central air conditioning and appellant's comparable #3 has finished basement that was not refuted by the appellant. The board of review also asserted comparable #1 is located in a flood plain and provided a map while comparable #5 was originally built in 1915 as a 1,686 square foot Cape Code with an addition and remodeling in 2002.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information prepared by the township assessor on six comparable sales located within .57 of a mile from the subject and have the same assessment neighborhood code as the subject. The comparables are reported to have sites ranging in size from approximately 8,761 to 24,298 square feet of land area and are improved with 2-story or 2.5-story dwellings of brick, Dryvit or frame exterior construction built from 2004 to 2010. The dwellings range in size from 4,694 to 5,298 square feet of living area and have basements, four of which have finished area. Each comparable has central air conditioning, two to four fireplaces and a garage ranging in size from 691 to 957 square feet of building area. The comparables sold from June 2020 to October 2021 for prices ranging from \$1,265,000 to \$1,500,000 or from \$258.27 to \$283.13 per square foot of living area, land included. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

In written rebuttal, counsel for the appellant contended that board of review comparables #2 and #3 are not comparable to the subject due to differences in style and/or finished basement area.

#### **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The Board finds the parties submitted 15 comparable sales to support their respective positions. The Board gives less weight to appellant's comparables #1, #3, #5, #6, #8 and #9 as well as board of review comparables #2, #3, #5 and #6 which have finished basement area unlike the subject.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be appellant's comparables #2, #4 and #7 as well as board of review comparables #1 and #4. These comparables are relatively similar to the subject in location, age, dwelling size and some features. These comparables sold from April 2020 to August 2021 for prices ranging from \$950,000 to \$1,375,000 or from \$179.35 to \$263.26 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$1,284,804 or \$258.04 per square foot of living area, including land, which falls within the range established by the best comparables sales in this record. Therefore, after considering adjustments to the best comparables for differences when compared to the subject, the Board finds a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

| 2.          | 1. Fen         |
|-------------|----------------|
|             | Chairman       |
| a de R      | Robert Stoffen |
| Member      | Member         |
| Dan Dikinin | Swah Schler    |
| Member      | Member         |
| DISSENTING: |                |

# **CERTIFICATION**

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

| Date: | November 21, 2023                 |
|-------|-----------------------------------|
|       | Middle 1/5                        |
|       | Clade of the Property Town Append |

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

# **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

# PARTIES OF RECORD

# **AGENCY**

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

# **APPELLANT**

Abdul Malaki, by attorney: Jessica Hill-Magiera Attorney at Law 790 Harvest Drive Lake Zurich, IL 60047

# **COUNTY**

DuPage County Board of Review DuPage Center 421 N. County Farm Road Wheaton, IL 60187