



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Richard Catrambone
DOCKET NO.: 21-06688.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 18-24-477-008

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Richard Catrambone, the appellant, by Jessica Hill-Magiera, Attorney at Law in Lake Zurich; and the McHenry County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds **No Change** in the assessment of the property as established by the **McHenry** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$23,326
IMPR.: \$104,588
TOTAL: \$127,914

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the McHenry County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2021 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a 1-story Augusta model dwelling of frame and brick exterior construction with 2,308 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 2000. Features of the home include a full walk-out style basement, central air conditioning, one fireplace and a 604 square foot garage.¹ The property has an approximately 12,655 square foot site and is located in Lake in the Hills, Grafton Township, McHenry County.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted limited information on three comparable sales located within 0.16 of a mile from the subject property. The comparable sites are improved with Bayhill, Oakland and Pebble Beach model dwellings ranging in size from 2,295 to 2,487 square feet of living area. The

¹ Some subject property details, not included in the parties' grid analyses were found in the subject's property record card, submitted by the board of review.

dwellings were built in 1995 or 2006. Each comparable has a walk-out style basement, one fireplace and a 2-car or a 3-car garage. The properties sold from May 2019 to August 2021 for prices ranging from \$255,000 to \$345,000 or from \$111.11 to \$138.72 per square foot of living area, land included. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested the subject's total assessment be reduced to \$99,375 which reflects a market value of \$298,155 or \$129.18 per square foot of living area, land included, when applying the statutory level of assessment of 33.33%.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$127,914. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$384,011 or \$166.38 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2021 three-year average median level of assessment for McHenry County of 33.31% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

The board of review, through the Grafton Township Assessor, critiqued the appellant's comparables asserting the dwellings are each "1+2 story" in contrast to the subject's 1-story design which was not refuted by the appellant. The assessor further argued its comparables are the same Augusta model as the subject property.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on four comparable sales located in the Boulder Ridge–Fairway Homes subdivision. The comparables have sites that range in size from 7,122 to 11,658 square feet of land area and are improved with 1-story Augusta model dwellings ranging in size from 2,170 to 2,255 square feet of living area. The homes were built from 1991 to 1999. Each comparable has a basement, with two being walk-out in style. Three comparables have one or two fireplaces and each comparable has a garage ranging in size from 436 to 714 square feet of building area. Comparables #1 and #2 each have a screen porch. The properties sold from October 2020 to October 2021 for prices ranging from \$306,000 to \$425,000 or from \$135.70 to \$195.58 per square foot of living area, land included. Comparable #4 is reported in the board of review's grid analysis as "NOT ADVERTISED FOR SALE" under type of sale. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested the subject's assessment be confirmed.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales, or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The parties submitted seven comparable sales for the Board's consideration. The Board gives less weight to each of the appellant's comparables which differ in design when compared to the subject. Furthermore, appellant comparable #3 sold in 2019, less proximate to the January 1, 2021 assessment date than other properties in the record. The Board also gives less weight to board of review comparable #4 which is disclosed as not being advertised on the open market,

one of the required elements of an arm's length transaction, and therefore calls into question whether the sale truly reflects market value.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be board of review comparables #1, #2 and #3 which are more similar to the subject in age, design, dwelling size and some other features. These comparables sold from October 2020 to May 2021 for prices ranging from \$306,000 to \$425,000 or from \$135.70 to \$195.58 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$384,011 or \$166.38 per square foot of living area, including land, which falls within the range established by the best comparable sales in this record. After considering appropriate adjustments to the comparables for differences from the subject, the Board finds the subject's assessment is justified and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.



Chairman



Member



Member



Member



Member

DISSENTING: _____

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: December 19, 2023



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois
Property Tax Appeal Board
William G. Stratton Building, Room 402
401 South Spring Street
Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Richard Catrambone, by attorney:
Jessica Hill-Magiera
Attorney at Law
790 Harvest Drive
Lake Zurich, IL 60047

COUNTY

McHenry County Board of Review
McHenry County Government Center
2200 N. Seminary Ave.
Woodstock, IL 60098