

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Richard Stanfel DOCKET NO.: 21-02739.001-R-1 PARCEL NO.: 12-20-410-008

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Richard Stanfel, the appellant, by attorney Robert Rosenfeld of Robert H. Rosenfeld & Associates, LLC in Chicago; and the Lake County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *no change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Lake** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$113,633 **IMPR.:** \$97,475 **TOTAL:** \$211,108

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

#### **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Lake County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2021 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

#### **Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a one-story dwelling of wood siding exterior construction with 2,605 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 1985 and is approximately 36 years old. Features of the home include a basement that is finished with a recreation room, central air conditioning, a fireplace and a 483 square foot garage. The property has an approximately 19,840 square foot site and is located in Lake Bluff, Shields Township, Lake County.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted information on four comparable sales located within .44 miles from the subject. The comparables have sites that range in size from 10,088 to 15,002 square feet of land area. The comparables are improved with one-story dwellings of brick exterior construction ranging in size from 2,051 to 2,748 square feet of living area. The dwellings are 58 to 68 years

old. The comparables each have a basement, two of which have finished area. Each comparable has central air conditioning, one or two fireplaces and a garage ranging in size from 462 to 600 square feet of building area. The comparables sold from March to October 2020 for prices ranging from \$420,000 to \$535,000 or from \$190.35 to \$204.78 per square foot of living area, including land. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment.

The appellant reported in the appeal petition that the subject property is an owner-occupied residence.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$211,108. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$634,911 or \$243.73 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2021 three-year average median level of assessment for Lake County of 33.25% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue. The board of review also disclosed the first year of the general assessment period was 2019 and township equalization factors of 1.0187 and 0.9945 were applied in the 2020 and 2021 tax years, respectively.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review argued the Property Tax Appeal Board issued a decision pertaining to the subject property for the 2019 tax year under Docket Number 19-05036.001-R-1. In that appeal, the Property Tax Appeal Board issued a decision based on an agreement between the parties lowering the subject's assessment to \$208,379. The board of review argued the subject's 2021 assessment reflects the Property Tax Appeal Board's 2019 decision plus application of the 2020 and 2021 equalization factors of 1.0187 and 0.9945, respectively, as provided by section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code. (35 ILCS 200/16-185). The board of review submitted a copy of the subject's property record card that revealed the subject received the general homestead exemption for the 2021 tax year, suggesting the property is an owner occupied residence.

The board of review also submitted information on five comparable sales located within .75 of a mile from the subject, one of which has the same assessment neighborhood code as the subject. The comparables have sites ranging in size from 8,400 to 59,700 square feet of land area. The comparables are improved with one-story dwellings of brick, wood siding or wood siding and brick exterior construction ranging in size from 2,011 or 3,258 square feet of living area. The dwellings were built from 1962 to 1987. The comparables each have a basement, one of which has finished area. Each comparable has central air conditioning, one or two fireplaces and a garage ranging in size from 483 to 624 square feet of building area. The comparables sold from April 2020 to November 2021 for prices ranging from \$550,000 to \$775,000 or from \$217.05 to \$312.78 per square foot of living area, including land. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

#### **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market

value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c).

The Property Tax Appeal Board finds the subject property was the matter of an appeal before this Board for the 2019 tax year under Docket Numbers 19-05036.001-R-1. In that appeal, the Property Tax Appeal Board rendered a decision lowering the subject's assessment to \$208,379 based on an agreement by the parties. The Property Tax Appeal Board takes notice that Lake County's quadrennial general assessment period began in the 2019 tax year and continues through the 2022 tax year. The Board further finds section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code is controlling in this appeal. (35 ILCS 200/16-185).

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel on which a residence occupied by the owner is situated, such reduced assessment, subject to equalization, shall remain in effect for the remainder of the general assessment period as provided in Sections 9-215 through 9-225, unless that parcel is subsequently sold in an arm's length transaction establishing a fair cash value for the parcel that is different from the fair cash value on which the Board's assessment is based, or unless the decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board is reversed or modified upon review.

The Board finds the record disclosed the subject property is an owner-occupied residence and the 2019 through 2021 tax years are within the same general assessment period. The Board finds the record shows equalization factors of 1.0187 and 0.9945 were issued in Shields Township for the 2020 and 2021 tax years, respectively. The record contains no evidence showing the Board's 2019 decision was reversed or modified upon review and there was no evidence the subject property sold in an arm's-length transaction establishing a different fair cash value. Applying section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-185) to the Board's 2019 tax year decision results in an assessment of \$211,108. (\$208,379 x 1.0187 x 0.9945 = \$211,108) which is equal to the subject's final 2021 assessment as established by the board of review.

Additionally, notwithstanding the dictates of Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code, the record contains nine sales comparables submitted by the parties to support their respective positions. The Board has given less weight to appellant's comparables, as well as board of review comparables #3 and #4 due to their older dwelling ages when compared to the subject. The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be board of review comparables #1, #2 and #5 which are most similar to the subject in age and somewhat similar to the subject in location, design and some features. However, the Board finds each dwelling is smaller in size when compared to the subject. Nevertheless, these three comparables sold from November 2020 to November 2021 for prices ranging from \$550,000 to \$629,000 or from \$217.05 to \$312.78 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$634,911 or \$243.73 per square foot of living area, land included, which falls above the range established by the best comparable sales in the record on overall market but within the range on a price per square foot basis. The subject's higher overall market value appears to be logical given its larger dwelling size. Based on this record, the Board finds the comparables demonstrate the subject property is correctly valued for assessment purposes.

For the foregoing reasons, the Property Tax Appeal Board finds that a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

	Chairman
CAR .	Sobot Stoffen
Member	Member
Dane De Kinin	Sarah Bokley
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	

# **CERTIFICATION**

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:	March 21, 2023
	14:1016
	Mallon

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

### **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

# PARTIES OF RECORD

#### **AGENCY**

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

#### **APPELLANT**

Richard Stanfel, by attorney: Robert Rosenfeld Robert H. Rosenfeld & Associates, LLC 33 North Dearborn Street Suite 1850 Chicago, IL 60602

# **COUNTY**

Lake County Board of Review Lake County Courthouse 18 North County Street, 7th Floor Waukegan, IL 60085