

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT:	Yousef Haswah
DOCKET NO.:	20-38994.001-R-1
PARCEL NO .:	27-26-408-017-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Yousef Haswah, the appellant, by attorney Jennifer Truong, of Behrens & Truong LLC in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *a reduction* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND:	\$6,189
IMPR.:	\$18,311
TOTAL:	\$24,500

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2020 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a 2-story dwelling of frame and masonry exterior construction with 2,976 square feet of living area. The dwelling is approximately 32 years old. Features of the home include a full basement with finished area, central air conditioning, a fireplace, an inground swimming pool, and a 2-car garage.¹ The property has a 11,790 square foot site and is located in Tinley Park, Orland Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-78 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant's appeal is based on overvaluation. In support of this argument the appellant submitted evidence disclosing the subject property was purchased on February 10, 2020 for a price of \$245,000; the parties to the transaction were not related; and the property was sold by a realtor and advertised for sale through the Multiple Listing Service (MLS). To document the sale

¹ The appellant's appraisal disclosed the subject has finished basement area and an inground swimming pool.

the appellant submitted the Settlement Statement which disclosed broker commissions were paid and the MLS sheet printout.

In further support, the appellant submitted an appraisal of the subject with an estimated market value of \$255,000 as of January 23, 2020.

Based on the foregoing evidence the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to reflect the recent sale of the subject property.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$31,366. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$313,660 or \$105.40 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the level of assessments for class 2 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance of 10%.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on two comparable sales located on same block as the subject and within the same assessment neighborhood code as the subject.² The comparables are situated on sites of 11,700 and 13,105 square feet of land area and are improved with 2-story dwellings of frame and masonry exterior construction with either 2,794 or 3,250 square feet of living area. The homes are 32 years old and have partial unfinished basements. Each comparable has central air conditioning, one fireplace, and a 2.5-car or a 3-car garage. The comparables sold in June 2019 and June 2020 for prices ranging of \$345,000 and \$358,700 or \$106.15 and \$128.38 per square foot of living area, including land. The board of review also disclosed the subject sold in February 2020 for \$245,000.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the purchase of the subject property in February 2020 for a price of \$245,000. The appellant provided evidence demonstrating the sale had the elements of an arm's length transaction. The appellant completed Section IV - Recent Sale Data of the appeal disclosing the parties to the transaction were not related, the property was sold using a Realtor, the property had been advertised on the open market with the Multiple Listing Service. In further support of the transaction the appellant submitted a copy of the settlement statement and the MLS sheet which disclosed the subject was exposed to the market. The Board finds the purchase price is below the market value reflected by the assessment. The Board finds the board of review did not present any evidence to challenge the arm's length nature

² The Board finds the board of review did not provide sales data for comparables #1 and #4 which do not address the appellant's overvaluation argument and will not be further considered in this analysis.

of the transaction. The Illinois Supreme Court has defined fair cash value as what the property would bring at a voluntary sale where the owner is ready, willing, and able to sell but not compelled to do so, and the buyer is ready, willing and able to buy but not forced to do so. <u>Springfield Marine Bank v. Property Tax Appeal Board</u>, 44 Ill.2d. 428, (1970). A contemporaneous sale of two parties dealing at arm's-length is not only relevant to the question of fair cash value but is practically conclusive on the issue of whether an assessment is reflective of market value. <u>Korzen v. Belt Railway Co. of Chicago</u>, 37 Ill.2d 158 (1967). The Board also gives less weight to the board of review comparables and the appellant's appraisal as they do not overcome the arm's length sale of the subject property. Based on this record the Board finds a reduction in the subject's assessment commensurate with the appellant's request is appropriate.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

Chairman Member Member Member Member **DISSENTING:**

<u>CERTIFICATION</u>

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:

June 18, 2024

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND</u> <u>EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Yousef Haswah, by attorney: Jennifer Truong Behrens & Truong LLC 53 West Jackson Boulevard Suite 962 Chicago, IL 60604

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review County Building, Room 601 118 North Clark Street Chicago, IL 60602