

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

| APPELLANT:   | Idiculla & Pushpa Joseph |
|--------------|--------------------------|
| DOCKET NO .: | 20-08483.001-R-1         |
| PARCEL NO .: | 03-22-323-009            |

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Idiculla & Pushpa Joseph, the appellants, by Jessica Hill-Magiera, Attorney at Law in Lake Zurich; and the DuPage County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *a reduction* in the assessment of the property as established by the **DuPage** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

| LAND:  | \$53,740  |
|--------|-----------|
| IMPR.: | \$79,530  |
| TOTAL: | \$133,270 |

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

## **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellants timely filed the appeal from a decision of the DuPage County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2020 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

## **Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a two-story dwelling of brick and frame exterior construction with 2,660 square feet of living area.<sup>1</sup> The dwelling was constructed in 1972. Features of the home include a basement, central air conditioning, a fireplace and a 462 square foot garage. The property has a 13,500 square foot site and is located in Addison, Addison Township, DuPage County.

The appellants contend overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument, the appellants submitted information on four comparable sales with the same assessment neighborhood code as the subject and located within .71 of a mile from the subject property. The comparables are improved with two-story dwellings ranging in size from 2,430 to 2,633 square feet of living area. The dwellings were built from 1978 to 1996. Each comparable has a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The Board finds the best description of the subject property was presented by the board of review.

basement, central air conditioning, a fireplace and a garage ranging in size from 390 to 537 square feet of building area. The comparables sold from July 2019 to November 2020 for prices ranging from \$317,500 to \$370,500 or from \$123.81 to \$146.10 per square foot of living area, including land. Based on this evidence, the appellants requested the subject's assessment be reduced to \$114,575, which would reflect a market value of \$343,759 or \$129.23 per square foot of living area, including land, when using the statutory level of assessment of 33.33%.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$136,550. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$408,832 or \$153.70 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2020 threeyear average median level of assessment for DuPage County of 33.40% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

The board of review submitted an assessment data sheet which lists the appellants' comparables and the township assessor's comparables. The appellants' comparables were described as having sites that range in size from 7,504 to 12,474 square feet of land area and dwellings with frame or frame and brick exteriors.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review, through the township assessor, submitted information on four comparable sales with the same assessment neighborhood code as the subject. The comparables have sites that range in size from 7,353 to 22,500 square feet of land area. The comparables are improved with two-story dwellings of frame and brick exterior construction ranging in size from 2,608 to 3,086 square feet of living area. The dwellings were built from 1959 to 1992. The comparables each have a basement, two of which have finished area. Each comparable has central air conditioning and a garage ranging in size from 440 to 576 square feet of building area. Three comparables each have a fireplace. The comparables sold from January 2018 to July 2020 for prices ranging from \$330,000 to \$510,750 or from \$126.53 to \$186.27 per square foot of living area, including land. The board of review also submitted a location map depicting the locations of all the comparables presented by the parties in relation to the subject property, as well as property record cards for the subject and both parties' comparables. Based on this evidence, board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

In written rebuttal, counsel for the appellants contended that board of review comparables #1, #3 and #4 are not comparable due to their remote 2018 sale dates. In addition, counsel argued that board of review comparable #4 is 16% larger than the subject dwelling. In a rebuttal grid analysis, counsel suggested that the appellants' four comparable sales and board of review comparable sale #2 are the best comparable sales in the record and contended the subject's assessment should be reduced.

# **Conclusion of Law**

The appellants contend the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or

construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellants met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The record contains eight suggested comparable sales for the Board's consideration. The Board has given less weight to the appellants' comparables #2, #3 and #4 due to their newer dwelling ages when compared to the subject. The Board has given reduced weight to board of review comparables #1, #3 and #4 due to differences from the subject in dwelling age and their sale dates occurring in 2018, which are less proximate in time to the lien date at issue and are less likely to be indicative of the subject's market value as of January 1, 2020 given other sales available in the record.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the appellants' comparable #1 and board of review comparable #2, which sold proximate in time to the assessment date at issue and are similar to the subject in location, dwelling size, design, age and some features. The comparables sold in November and July 2020 for prices of \$370,500 and \$410,000 or for \$146.10 and \$153.21 square foot of living area, including land, respectively. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$408,832 or \$153.70 per square foot of living area, including land, which is bracketed by the two best comparable sales in the record in terms of overall market value but greater than the comparables on a price per square foot basis. After considering adjustments to the best comparables for differences when compared to the subject, the Board finds the subject's estimated market value as reflected by its assessment is excessive. Therefore, based on this record the Board finds a reduction in the subject's assessment is justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

Chairman Member Member Member Member **DISSENTING:** 

## CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:

May 16, 2023

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

## **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND</u> <u>EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

## PARTIES OF RECORD

#### AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

#### APPELLANT

Idiculla & Pushpa Joseph, by attorney: Jessica Hill-Magiera Attorney at Law 790 Harvest Drive Lake Zurich, IL 60047

#### COUNTY

DuPage County Board of Review DuPage Center 421 N. County Farm Road Wheaton, IL 60187