

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Ammar Shaikh
DOCKET NO.: 19-53458.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 30-08-330-005-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Ammar Shaikh, the appellant, by attorney George N. Reveliotis, of Reveliotis Law, P.C. in Park Ridge; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds <u>a reduction</u> in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$1,015 **IMPR.:** \$2,795 **TOTAL:** \$3,810

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2019 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a 1.5-story dwelling of frame exterior construction with 1,196 square feet of living area. The dwelling is approximately 97 years old and has a basement.¹ The property has a 3,125 square foot site and is located in Calumet City, Thornton Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-03 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted information on four comparable sales that have the same assessment neighborhood code as the subject. The comparables are described as having sites ranging from

¹ For the subject's basement area, the appellant reported "Craw and Formal Rec. Room" and the board of review reported "full unfinished." Although the parties agree the subject has a basement; the board is unable to determine if it has a partial or a full basement or if the basement has a finished area.

4,340 to 6,200 square feet of land area that are improved with class 2-03 dwellings of frame exterior construction ranging in size from 1,008 to 1,515 square feet of living area. The dwellings are from 69 to 104 years old. Each comparable has an unfinished basement, two comparables each have central air conditioning, and three comparables have either a 2-car or a 2.5-car garage. The comparables sold from January 2017 to September 2019 for prices ranging from \$24,001 to \$48,650 or from \$23.81 to \$41.19 per square foot of building area, including land.

Based on this evidence the appellant requested the subject's total assessment be reduced to \$3,810. The requested assessment reflects a market value of \$38,100 or \$31.86 per square foot of living area, land included, when applying the level of assessment for class 2 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance of 10%.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$5,799. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$57,990 or \$48.49 per square foot of living area, including land, when applying the level of assessment for class 2 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance of 10%.

In support of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on four comparable sales that have the same assessment neighborhood code as the subject. The comparables are described as having sites ranging from 3,100 to 4,950 square feet of land area that are improved with class 2-03, dwellings of frame or masonry exterior construction ranging in size from 1,000 to 1,270 square feet of living area. The dwellings are from 60 to 114 years old. Each comparable has an unfinished basement and either a 1.5-car or a 2-car garage. The comparables sold from February 2016 to December 2019 for prices ranging from \$21,500 to \$82,900 or from \$16.93 to \$78.50 per square foot of building area, including land. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested that the assessment be confirmed.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The record contains a total of eight comparable sales for the Board's consideration. The Board gives less weight to the appellant's comparable sales #1, #3 and #4 along with board of review comparable sales #3 and #4 which differ from the subject in age, dwelling size, and/or have 2016 or 2017 sale dates that occurred less proximate in time to the January 1, 2019 assessment date at issue for the subject property. The Board also gives less weight to board of review comparable #2 which appears to be an outlier with its significantly higher sale price in relation to the other sales in the record.

The Board finds the best evidence of the subject's market value to be the appellant's comparable #2 and board of review comparable #1 which sold more proximate in time to the subject's assessment date at issue and are relatively similar to the subject in location, age, dwelling size, and some features. These two comparables sold in July 2018 and February 2019 for prices of \$24,001 and \$26,000 or \$23.81 and \$26.00 per square foot of living area, land included. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$57,990 or \$48.49 per square foot of living area, land included, which falls above the two best comparable sales in the record. After considering adjustments to the comparable sales for differences when compared to the subject, the Board finds a reduction in the subject's assessment commensurate with the appellant's request is justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

| 2 | 1. Fer |
|--------------|----------------|
| | Chairman |
| a R | Robert Stoffen |
| Member | Member |
| Dan De Kinin | Sarah Bokley |
| Member | Member |
| DISSENTING: | |

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

| Date: | May 21, 2024 |
|-------|--|
| - | 141:10)16 |
| | Mana |
| - | Clade of the December Town Assessed December |

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Ammar Shaikh, by attorney: George N. Reveliotis Reveliotis Law, P.C. 1030 Higgins Road Suite 101 Park Ridge, IL 60068

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review County Building, Room 601 118 North Clark Street Chicago, IL 60602