



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION  
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Earl Stoxstell - Chicago Title Trust  
DOCKET NO.: 19-49244.001-R-1  
PARCEL NO.: 31-35-212-015-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Earl Stoxstell - Chicago Title Trust, the appellant, by attorney Jessica Hill-Magiera, Attorney at Law in Lake Zurich; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds **A Reduction** in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$2,214  
**IMPR.:** \$ 786  
**TOTAL:** \$3,000

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

**Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2019 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

**Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a one-story, single-family dwelling of frame and masonry construction with 974 square feet of living area. The dwelling is 65 years old. The property has a 7,380 square foot site, and is located in Rich Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-02 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance. The appellant indicated that the subject property was not owner-occupied.

The appellant's appeal is based on overvaluation. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted evidence disclosing the subject property was purchased on November 7, 2018, for a price of \$30,000, or \$30.80 per square foot, including land pursuant to a foreclosure action. The Seller is listed as the Secretary of Housing and Urban Development while the Purchaser is Servani Real Estate Investment Group LLC. The MLS listing sheet confirmed the sale.

The appellant also submitted information on six sale comparables. The comparables sold between July 2018 and June 2019 for sale prices ranging from \$15.53 to \$26.69 per square foot, including land. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to \$2,127.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted its Notes on Appeal indicating the subject's current assessed value is \$5,894. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$58,940, or \$60.51 per square foot of living area, including land, when applying the statutory level of assessment for class 2 property of 10% under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on three sale comparables, each of which reflected equity data. The comparables sold between March 2018 and November 2018 for sale prices ranging from \$55.51 to \$62.17 per square foot, including land. The sale of the subject in November 2018 for \$30,000, or \$30.80 per square foot, including land, was also reflected on the grid sheet. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

In written rebuttal, the appellant argued that the best evidence of market value is the subject's recent sale price.

### **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant has met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The Board finds that the sale of the subject in November 2018 for \$30,000 was a "compulsory sale." A "compulsory sale" is defined as:

- (i) the sale of real estate for less than the amount owed to the mortgage lender or mortgagor, if the lender or mortgagor has agreed to the sale, commonly referred to as a "short sale" and
- (ii) the first sale of real estate owned by a financial institution as a result of a judgment of foreclosure, transfer pursuant to a deed in lieu of foreclosure, or consent judgment, occurring after the foreclosure proceeding is complete.

35 ILCS 200/1-23. The Board finds that the sale of the subject is a compulsory sale, in the form of a foreclosure sale, based on the parties' documentation.

Real property in Illinois must be assessed at its fair cash value, which can only be estimated absent any compulsion on either party.

Illinois law requires that all real property be valued at its fair cash value, estimated at the price it would bring at a fair voluntary sale where the owner is ready, willing, and able to sell but not compelled to do so, and the buyer is likewise ready, willing, and able to buy, but is not forced to do so.

Bd. of Educ. of Meridian Cmty. Unit Sch. Dist. No. 223 v. Ill. Prop. Tax Appeal Bd., 2012 IL App (2d) 100068, ¶ 36 (citing Chrysler Corp. v. Ill. Prop. Tax Appeal Bd., 69 Ill.App.3d 207, 211 (2d Dist. 1979)).

In considering the compulsory sale of the subject, the Board may look to the market value evidence submitted by the parties to determine whether the purchase price was at the subject's fair market value. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). Such evidence may consist of the sales of comparables properties. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c)(4); see, Calumet Transfer, LLC v. Ill. Prop. Tax Appeal Bd., 401 Ill.App.3d 652, 655-56 (1st Dist. 2010) (“[The Board] allowed the [intervenor] to challenge the arm's-length nature of the transaction by offering evidence of comparable property sales. This was permissible under paragraph (4) of section 1910.65(c).”)

In the instant appeal, the parties submitted a total of nine sale comparables. The Board finds the appellant's comparable(s) #1 through #3, as well as the board of review comparables #2 and #3, to be most similar to the subject based on a combination of location, size, design and age. These comparables sold for prices ranging from \$21.82 to \$55.74 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's current assessment reflects a market value of \$60.51 per square foot of living area, including land, which is above this range. Moreover, the subject's compulsory sale price reflects a market value of \$30.80 per square foot of living area, including land, which is within the range established by the best comparables in this record. Therefore, the Board finds that the sale of the subject in November 2018 for \$30,000 was reflective of the subject's fair market value as of January 1, 2019. Based on the evidence contained in this record, the Board finds that the appellant has proven by a preponderance of the evidence that the subject is overvalued, and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.



\_\_\_\_\_  
Chairman



\_\_\_\_\_  
Member



\_\_\_\_\_  
Member

\_\_\_\_\_  
Member



\_\_\_\_\_  
Member

DISSENTING: \_\_\_\_\_

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: June 27, 2023



\_\_\_\_\_  
Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

**IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois  
Property Tax Appeal Board  
William G. Stratton Building, Room 402  
401 South Spring Street  
Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Earl Stoxstell Chicago Title Trust, by attorney:  
Jessica Hill-Magiera  
Attorney at Law  
790 Harvest Drive  
Lake Zurich, IL 60047

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review  
County Building, Room 601  
118 North Clark Street  
Chicago, IL 60602