



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Johan Joseph
DOCKET NO.: 19-45108.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 14-32-127-016-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Johan Joseph, the appellant(s), by attorney Noah J. Schmidt, of Schmidt Salzman & Moran, Ltd. in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds **A Reduction** in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$34,375
IMPR.: \$92,909
TOTAL: \$127,284

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2019 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a 20-year-old, three-story, multi-family dwelling of masonry construction with 3,510 square feet of living area. Features of the building include three full bathrooms. The property has a 3,125 square foot site located in Chicago, North Chicago Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-11 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted information on five suggested equity comparables. They were improved with a three-story, multi-family dwelling of masonry construction. The improvements ranged: in age from 12 to 121 years old; in size from 3,216 to 3,498 square feet; and in improvement assessment from \$22.80 to \$25.31 per square foot of living area. Four of the comparable properties had three full bathrooms.

The appellant also submitted a brief asserting that the ongoing Covid-19 Pandemic impacted the residential real estate market in a negative way and a reduction in the subject's assessment is requested to reflect the burden placed on homeowners.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$140,377. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$106,002 or \$30.20 per square foot of living area. In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on four suggested equity comparables. Each are improved with either a two-story or three-story multi-family dwelling of masonry construction. The improvements ranged: in age from 22 to 34 years old; in size from 3,705 to 4,026 square feet of living area; and in assessment from \$30.14 to \$32.45 per square foot. Each of the comparable properties had three full bathrooms and a two-car garage. Additionally, three comparable properties had full basements.

Conclusion of Law

As a preliminary matter, the appellant requests that the PTAB grant it relief based on the COVID-19 pandemic. The PTAB distinguishes between a request for relief just because the pandemic occurred ("COVID Relief") and a request based on the pandemic's effect on market conditions or the income-producing capacity of a given property. The former would only require the appellant to show that the pandemic occurred -not that the pandemic affected or contributed to changes in the relevant market or other factors related to the property's assessment. The latter would require the appellant to meet its burden to provide substantive evidence or legal argument sufficient to challenge the property's assessment.

As an administrative agency, the Property Tax Appeal Board only has the authority that the General Assembly confers on it by statute. *Spiel v. Property Tax Appeal Bd.*, 309 Ill. App. 3d 373, 378 (2d Dist. 1999). Consequently, to the extent that the PTAB acts outside its statutory authority, it acts without jurisdiction. See *Bd. of Educ. of City of Chicago v. Bd. of Trustees of Pub. Sch. Teachers' Pension & Ret. Fund of Chicago*, 395 Ill. App. 3d 735, 739-40 (1st Dist. 2009). The Board has no statutory authority to reduce assessments solely because the pandemic occurred (i.e., to grant "COVID Relief"). However, if an appellant presents evidence demonstrating the pandemic resulted in or contributed to a reduction in the subject property's assessment, that may serve as the basis for a reduction. But the appellant is not entitled to a reduction just because the pandemic occurred. The Board finds the appellant in the instant case did not present evidence demonstrating the pandemic resulted in or contributed to a reduction in the subject property's assessment. More importantly, the lien year in the instant appeal is 2019, which is prior to the COVID-19 pandemic. Therefore, appellant is not entitled to a reduction on the basis of the COVID-19 pandemic.

The taxpayer contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86

Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b). The Board finds the appellant *did meet* this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment *is warranted*.

The Board finds the best evidence of assessment equity to be *appellant's comparables #1, #2, and #5, and the board of review's comparable #1*. These comparables were most similar to the subject property in living area square footage and had improvement assessments that ranged from \$22.80 to \$30.14 per square foot of living area. All of the comparables submitted by both parties were similar to the subject property in construction and close to it in proximity so lesser weight was given to the comparables with greater differences in living area square footage. The subject's improvement assessment of \$30.20 per square foot of living area falls above the range established by the best comparables in this record. Based on this record the Board finds the appellant *did* demonstrate with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement was inequitably assessed and a reduction in the subject's assessment *is justified*.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.



Chairman



Member



Member



Member



Member

DISSENTING: _____

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:

May 16, 2023



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois
Property Tax Appeal Board
William G. Stratton Building, Room 402
401 South Spring Street
Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Johan Joseph, by attorney:
Noah J. Schmidt
Schmidt Salzman & Moran, Ltd.
111 West Washington Street
Suite 1300
Chicago, IL 60602

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review
County Building, Room 601
118 North Clark Street
Chicago, IL 60602