

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Wei Liu

DOCKET NO.: 19-41465.001-R-1 PARCEL NO.: 14-31-104-048-1002

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Wei Liu, the appellant(s), by attorney Stephanie Park, of Park & Longstreet, P.C. in Inverness; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds **no change** in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$5,809 **IMPR.:** \$54,182 **TOTAL:** \$59,991

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

### **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2019 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

#### **Findings of Fact**

The subject property is a residential condominium unit contained in a 15-year-old, two-unit, two-story, residential condominium building of masonry construction. Each unit is designated by a Property Index Number (PIN). The subject unit is designated PIN 1002 and owns 53.00% of the common elements. The property is situated on 2,409 square feet in West Chicago Township, Cook County. The property is a Class 2-99 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant's appeal is based on overvaluation. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted a settlement statement that disclosed the subject property was purchased from Citimortgage, Inc. [sic] on February 27, 2019, for \$406,000. The settlement statement does not

disclose a mortgage was used in the transaction. Title insurance was processed through National Default REO Services, LLC. The appellant included information in Section IV–Recent Sale Data of the Residential Appeal that the subject was sold by Citi Mortgage, Inc.; was not sold as a transfer between related parties; was advertised and sold through a realtor; was not sold using a contract for deed; and was not sold in settlement of a foreclosure. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to reflect the purchase price when using the 2019 level of assessment of 10.00% for Class 2 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$59,991. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$599,910 when using the 2019 level of assessment of 10.00% for Class 2 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance. In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted a condominium analysis with information on suggested comparable sales for one unit, PIN 1001, in the building. This unit sold in 2018 for a total consideration of \$532,000. The units sold comprised of 47.00% the common elements of the building. The result was a full value of the property at \$1,131,914. Since the subject owned 53.00% of the common elements, the board of review suggested assessment of the subject was \$59,991.

In rebuttal, the appellant asserted the subject's sale was an arm's-length transaction and reaffirmed the request for an assessment reduction.

At hearing, the appellant reiterated its argument that the sale was at arm's-length and was the best evidence of market value. The board of review opined the sale was compulsory because it was the first sale of real estate owned by a financial institution after a foreclosure.

### **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant has not met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

In addressing the appellant's market value argument, the Board finds that the sale of the subject in February 2019 for \$406,000 is a "compulsory sale." The evidence disclosed that the subject was sold as "REO" property. REO is an abbreviation for "real estate owned." Black's Law Dictionary, "REO" (10<sup>th</sup> ed. 2014). Real Estate Owned is defined as "Property acquired by a lender, usu. through foreclosure, in satisfaction of a debt. - Abbr. REO." Black's Law Dictionary, "real estate owned" (10<sup>th</sup> ed. 2014). A "compulsory sale" is defined as:

(i) the sale of real estate for less than the amount owed to the mortgage lender or mortgagor, if the lender or mortgagor has agreed to the sale, commonly referred

to as a "short sale" and (ii) the first sale of real estate owned by a financial institution as a result of a judgment of foreclosure, transfer pursuant to a deed in lieu of foreclosure, or consent judgment, occurring after the foreclosure proceeding is complete.

#### 35 ILCS 200/1-23.

Real property in Illinois must be assessed at its fair cash value, which can only be estimated absent any compulsion on either party.

Illinois law requires that all real property be valued at its fair cash value, estimated at the price it would bring at a fair voluntary sale where the owner is ready, willing, and able to sell but not compelled to do so, and the buyer is likewise ready, willing, and able to buy, but is not forced to do so.

Bd. of Educ. of Meridian Cmty. Unit Sch. Dist. No. 223 v. Ill. Prop. Tax Appeal Bd., 961 N.E. 2d 794, 802 (2d Dist. 2011) (citing Chrysler Corp. v. Ill. Prop. Tax Appeal Bd., 69 Ill. App. 3d 207, 211 (2d Dist. 1979)).

The Board may consider market value evidence, such as sales of comparable properties submitted by the parties, to determine whether the subject was sold at fair cash value. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c)(4); *See* Calumet Transfer LLC v. Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board, 401 Ill.App.3d 652 (1st Dist. 2010).

The appellant did not submit comparable properties or other evidence to establish that the sale of the subject was for fair cash value. The board of review submitted a condominium analysis based on the sale of one unit in the subject's building. The board of review based the subject's assessment on this sale and extrapolated it from calculating the common elements ownership of the various units.

Regardless of the board of review's method of analysis, the appellant did not submit evidence of overvaluation other than the settlement statement that disclosed the sale was compulsory. In determining the fair cash value of the subject property and all relevant factors, the Board finds that the appellant did not submit enough evidence to show the subject was overvalued. Therefore, the Board finds that the appellant has not met its burden by a preponderance of the evidence and that the subject does not warrant a reduction based upon the market data submitted into evidence.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

21. Fer		
Chairman		
C. R.		Aster Stoffen
Member		Member
Dan De Kinin		Sarah Bokley
Member		Member
DISSENTING:		
<u>CERTIFICATION</u>		
As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.		
	Date:	January 16, 2024

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

**IMPORTANT NOTICE** 

#### Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

## PARTIES OF RECORD

#### **AGENCY**

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

#### **APPELLANT**

Wei Liu, by attorney: Stephanie Park Park & Longstreet, P.C. 1620 W Colonial Pkwy. Inverness, IL 60067

#### **COUNTY**

Cook County Board of Review County Building, Room 601 118 North Clark Street Chicago, IL 60602