

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Andrzej Chmenia DOCKET NO.: 19-38288.001-R-1 PARCEL NO.: 20-25-208-028-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Andrzej Chmenia, the appellant, by attorney Ellen G. Berkshire, of Verros Berkshire in Oakbrook Terrace; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$6,300 **IMPR.:** \$12,211 **TOTAL:** \$18,511

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

#### **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2019 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

#### **Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a two-story, multi-family dwelling of frame construction with 1,914 square feet of living area. The building is 120 years old. Features of the home include a full unfinished basement, four bedrooms, one full bathroom, two half-bathrooms and one fireplace. The property has a 5,040 square foot site and is located in Chicago, Hyde Park Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-11 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant asserts overvaluation in this appeal. In support of the overvaluation argument, the appellant submitted evidence disclosing that the subject property was purchased on September 19, 2018, for a price of \$5,000. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to reflect the purchase price.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$18,511. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$185,110 or \$96.71 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the Cook County Real Estate Classification Ordinance level of assessment for class 2 property of 10%. The subject's improvement assessment is \$12,211, or \$6.38 per square foot of living area. The board of review also stated that the subject property sold for \$399,000 on November 21, 2019.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on four suggested sales comparables.

#### **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill. Admin. Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill. Admin. Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The Board concludes that the best evidence of the subject's market value are the board of review's sales comparables #2, #3 and #4. Like the subject property, these comparables have a two-story, multi-family dwelling of frame construction, with a full basement, no central air conditioning or garage, and are all located in Hyde Park, as is the subject property.

These comparables sold between January 2018, and September 2019, for amounts ranging from \$253.49 to \$375.00 per square foot of living area, land included in the sale price. The subject property's assessment reflects a market value of \$185,110, land included, or \$96.71 per square foot of living area, which is below the range established by the best comparables in the record. Accordingly, the Board determines that the appellant has failed to establish by a preponderance of the evidence that the subject property was overvalued. Based on the evidence, the Board therefore finds that a reduction in the subject's assessment on this basis is not justified.

The Board finds that the 2018 sale of the subject property did not offer the best evidence of market value. The appellant provided evidence demonstrating the sale did not have the elements of an arm's length transaction. The appellant completed Section IV - Recent Sale Data of the PTAB residential appeal form and disclosed that while the parties to the transaction were not related, the property was never listed for sale and was in fact sold pursuant to a tax sale. The appellant also submitted a copy of the settlement statement from the transaction.

Therefore, based on this record the Board finds the tax sale of the subject property did not accurately reflect its market value with its purchase price of \$5,000. A reduction in the subject's assessment commensurate with the appellant's request is therefore not appropriate.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

	Chairman
C. R.	Robert Stoffen
Member	Member
Dan Dikini	Sarah Bokley
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	

## **CERTIFICATION**

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:	July 18, 2023
	14:1016
	Mano
-	

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

#### **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

## PARTIES OF RECORD

#### **AGENCY**

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

#### **APPELLANT**

Andrzej Chmenia, by attorney: Ellen G. Berkshire Verros Berkshire 1S660 Midwest Road Suite 300 Oakbrook Terrace, IL 60181

## **COUNTY**

Cook County Board of Review County Building, Room 601 118 North Clark Street Chicago, IL 60602