



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: 912 Ashland LLC
DOCKET NO.: 19-36191.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 17-06-432-019-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are 912 Ashland LLC, the appellant, by attorney Robert Rosenfeld, of Robert H. Rosenfeld & Associates, LLC in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds **A Reduction** in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$9,435
IMPR.: \$56,865
TOTAL: \$66,300

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2019 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a 3-story multi-family building of masonry exterior construction with 3,345 square feet of building area¹. The building is approximately 102 years old. Features of the building include an unfinished full basement. The property has a 2,725 square foot site located in Chicago, West Chicago Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-11 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

¹ The subject's property characteristics were provided in the appellant's evidence. The board of review's description of the subject differed significantly from the appellant's description found in the appellant's grid analysis and Section III of the Residential Appeal petition. The Board finds the best evidence of the subject was presented by the appellant as well as the Property Tax Appeal Board takes judicial notice of its decision issued on the property in Docket Number 18-43679 in terms of the characteristics of the subject.

The appellant contends assessment inequity with respect to the improvement as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted information on four equity comparables with the same neighborhood code as the subject property. The comparables are improved with class 2-11 multi-family buildings of masonry exterior construction that range in size from 3,780 to 4,089 square feet of building area. The comparables range in age from 107 to 125 years old. Each comparable has an unfinished basement. The comparables have improvement assessments ranging from \$60,178 to \$64,628 or from \$15.75 to \$16.47 per square foot of building area. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested that the subject's improvement assessment be reduced to \$53,453 or \$15.98 per square foot of building area.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$82,136. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$72,701 or \$21.73 per square foot of building area. In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on one equity comparable with the same neighborhood code as the subject property. The comparable is improved with a 2-story building of frame exterior construction with 2,460 square feet of building area. The comparable is 125 years old. The comparable has a concrete slab foundation and a one-car garage. The comparable has an improvement assessment of \$47,213 or \$19.19 per square foot of building area. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested the subject's assessment be confirmed.

Conclusion of Law

The taxpayer contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b). The Board finds the appellant met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The parties submitted five suggested comparables for the Board's consideration. The Board gives less weight to the appellant's comparables #1 and #2 as well as the board of review comparable #1 due to differences from the subject in building size and/or story height/foundation type.

The Board finds the best evidence of assessment equity to be the appellant's comparables #3 and #4 which are relatively similar to the subject in design, age, building size and features. The two most similar comparables have improvement assessments of \$60,178 and \$64,628 or \$15.92 and \$16.47 per square foot of building area, respectively. The subject's improvement assessment of \$72,701 or \$21.73 per square foot of building area falls above the improvement assessments of the two best comparables in the record and is excessive. After considering adjustments to the two best comparables for differences from the subject such as their larger size, the Board finds the appellant demonstrated with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement was inequitably assessed and a reduction in the subject's improvement assessment based on inequity is warranted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.



Chairman



Member



Member

Member



Member

DISSENTING: _____

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: June 27, 2023



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois
Property Tax Appeal Board
William G. Stratton Building, Room 402
401 South Spring Street
Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

912 Ashland LLC, by attorney:
Robert Rosenfeld
Robert H. Rosenfeld & Associates, LLC
33 North Dearborn Street
Suite 1850
Chicago, IL 60602

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review
County Building, Room 601
118 North Clark Street
Chicago, IL 60602