



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Robert Flannery III
DOCKET NO.: 19-34993.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 04-26-303-021-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Robert Flannery III, the appellant(s), by attorney James E. Doherty, of Tully & Associates, LTD. in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds **No Change** in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$14,177
IMPR.: \$45,674
TOTAL: \$59,851

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2019 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property is improved with a two-story, single-family dwelling of frame and masonry construction with 2,294 square feet of living area. The dwelling is 56 years old. Features of the dwelling include a partial unfinished basement, central air conditioning, and a two-car garage. The property has a 12,328 square foot site and is located in Glenview, Northfield Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-78 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant asserts assessment inequity as a basis of the appeal. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted information on eleven suggested equity comparables. Appellant requested a reduction of the subject's total assessment to \$55,010.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject as \$59,851. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$45,674 or \$19.91 per square foot of living area. In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on four suggested equity comparables.

A hearing was held before a Board administrative law judge on October 11, 2023. At the hearing, the appellant's attorney reviewed the evidence and stated that the appellant's comparable are very similar to the subject in location (five comparables on the same block), size and age. Appellant's attorney also stated that the board of review had reduced the property's assessed valuation in 2020. The board of review's analyst defined "clear and convincing evidence" per Illinois Statue as:

"Clear and convincing evidence means that measure or degree of proof that will produce in the mind of the trier of fact a high degree of certainty as to the truth of the allegations sought to be established." 735 ILCS 5/2-2101.

The board of review analyst emphasized the key phrase of "high degree of certainty." The board of review analyst further testified that the board of review's comparables are similar in location, age, and size and fall within the range. In rebuttal, the appellant's attorney distinguished the board of review's comparables #1 #3, and #4 based on location in that they are between 0.3 and 1.7miles from the subject per Google Maps. The board of review analyst refuted the appellant's argument that board of review's comparable #4 is over a mile away per section and township maps and that there is no difference between 0.25 and 0.3 miles away regarding comparables #1 and #3.

Conclusion of Law

The taxpayer asserts assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. The Illinois Constitution requires that real estate taxes "be levied uniformly by valuation ascertained as the General Assembly shall provide by law." Ill. Const., art. IX, § 4 (1970); Walsh v. Property Tax Appeal Board, 181 Ill. 2d 228, 234 (1998). This uniformity provision of the Illinois Constitution does not require absolute equality in taxation, however, and it is sufficient if the taxing authority achieves a reasonable degree of uniformity. Peacock v. Property Tax Appeal Board, 339 Ill. App. 3d 1060, 1070 (4th Dist. 2003).

When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill. Admin. Code §1910.63(e); Walsh, 181 Ill. 2d at 234 (1998). Clear and convincing evidence means more than a preponderance of the evidence, but it does not need to approach the degree of proof needed for a conviction of a crime. Bazyldo v. Volant, 164 Ill. 2d 207, 213 (1995). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86 Ill. Admin. Code §1910.65(b). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

As a preliminary matter, appellant's argument based upon the 2020 reduction of the subject's assessment is not persuasive because the relevant valuation date is January 1, 2019. 35 ILCS 200/9-155. The Board finds that the best evidence of assessment equity is the appellant's comparables #5, #7 and #8 and the board of review's comparables #1 and #3. These comparables are similar to the subject dwelling in age, basement, construction, number of baths and living area size.

These comparables had improvement assessments that ranged from \$18.75 to \$23.95 per square foot of living area. The subject's improvement assessment of \$19.91 per square foot of living area falls within the range established by the best comparables in this record. The Board therefore finds that the appellant did not demonstrate with clear and convincing evidence that the subject was inequitably assessed, and a reduction in the subject's assessment on this basis is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.



Chairman



Member



Member



Member



Member

DISSENTING: _____

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:

April 16, 2024



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois
Property Tax Appeal Board
William G. Stratton Building, Room 402
401 South Spring Street
Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Robert Flannery III, by attorney:
James E. Doherty
Tully & Associates, LTD.
33 North Dearborn Street
Suite 2450
Chicago, IL 60602

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review
County Building, Room 601
118 North Clark Street
Chicago, IL 60602