



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Ashok Shah
DOCKET NO.: 19-33877.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 09-15-110-033-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Ashok Shah, the appellant; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds ***no change*** in the assessment of the property as established by the Cook County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$1,930
IMPR.: \$11,173
TOTAL: \$13,103

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2019 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a two-story dwelling of masonry construction with 1,151 square feet of living area. The dwelling is 57 years old and has a full unfinished basement. The property has a 1,930 square foot site and is located in Des Plaines, Maine Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-95 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant contends assessment inequity with regard to the subject's improvement as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted information on four equity comparables that were located within the same neighborhood code as the subject property. The comparables were two-story dwellings of masonry or frame and masonry construction that contained either 1,151 or 1,550 square feet of living area. The homes were 53 or 57 years old and had other features with varying degrees of similarity to the subject. The comparables had

improvement assessments ranging from \$9,707 to \$12,860 or from \$8.07 to \$8.44 per square foot of living area.

Based on this evidence the appellant requested that the subject's assessment be reduced to \$11,492.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$13,103. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$11,173 or \$9.71 per square foot of living area. In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on four equity comparables that were located within the same neighborhood code as the subject property. The comparables were two-story dwellings of masonry construction that contained 1,151 square feet of living area. The homes were 57 years old and had other features with varying degrees of similarity to the subject. The comparables had improvement assessments ranging from \$11,189 to \$11,304 or from \$9.72 to \$9.82 per square foot of living area.

Based on this evidence the board of review requested that the subject's assessment be confirmed.

The appellant submitted rebuttal acknowledging that the board of review's properties were valid comparables. In addition, the appellant included information on four new comparable properties that were not previously submitted by the appellant.

Conclusion of Law

The taxpayer contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

As an initial matter regarding the appellant's rebuttal evidence of four new comparable properties that were not previously submitted by the appellant, the board finds it cannot consider this new evidence. Section 1910.66(c) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board states:

Rebuttal evidence shall not consist of new evidence such as an appraisal or **newly discovered comparable properties**. A party to the appeal shall be precluded from submitting its own case in chief in the guise of rebuttal evidence. (86 Ill.Adm.Code §1910.66(c)).

The parties submitted a total of eight comparable properties for the Board's consideration. The Board gave less weight to the appellant's comparables #1 and #2, due to their considerably larger sizes when compared to the subject. The Board finds the parties' remaining comparables were most similar to the subject in location, style, age, size and most features. These comparables had improvement assessments that ranged from \$9,707 to \$11,304 or from \$8.43 to \$9.82 per square

foot of living area. The subject's improvement assessment of \$11,173 or \$9.71 per square foot of living area falls within the range established by the best comparables in this record. Based on this record the Board finds the appellant did not demonstrate with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement was inequitably assessed and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

The constitutional provision for uniformity of taxation and valuation does not require mathematical equality. A practical uniformity, rather than an absolute one, is the test. Apex Motor Fuel Co. v. Barrett, 20 Ill.2d 395 (1960). Although the comparables presented by the parties disclosed that the properties located in the same area are not assessed at identical levels, all that the constitution requires is a practical uniformity, which exists on the basis of the evidence.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.



Chairman



Member



Member



Member



Member

DISSENTING: _____

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: February 16, 2021



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois
Property Tax Appeal Board
William G. Stratton Building, Room 402
401 South Spring Street
Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Ashok Shah
9247 Fern Lane
Des Plaines, IL 60016

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review
County Building, Room 601
118 North Clark Street
Chicago, IL 60602