

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Boris Nulman
DOCKET NO.: 19-31499.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 04-08-405-008-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Boris Nulman, the appellant, by attorney Robert Rosenfeld, of Robert H. Rosenfeld and Associates, LLC in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$41,223 **IMPR.:** \$64,485 **TOTAL:** \$105,708

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

#### **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2019 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

#### **Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a two-story dwelling of masonry exterior construction with 5,144 square feet of living area. The dwelling is approximately 19 years old. Features of the home include a partial basement with finished area, central air conditioning, one fireplace and a 3-car garage. The property has a 31,710 square foot site located in Northbrook, Northfield Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-09 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant contends assessment inequity with respect to the improvement as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted information on four equity comparables that are located within the same neighborhood code as the subject property. The comparables are improved with class 2-09 dwellings of masonry or frame and masonry exterior construction ranging in size from 5,146 to 6,567 square feet of living area. The dwellings range

in age from 25 to 35 years old. The comparables have full basements, three of which have finished area. Each comparable has central air conditioning, one to three fireplaces and a 3-car or a 3.5-car garage. The comparables have improvement assessments ranging from \$55,117 to \$75,402 or from \$10.59 to \$11.61 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested that the subject's improvement assessment be reduced to \$57,098 or \$11.10 per square foot of living area.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$105,708. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$64,485 or \$12.54 per square foot of living area. In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on four equity comparables that are located within the same neighborhood code as the subject property. The comparables are improved with two, two-story class 2-08 and two, two-story class 2-09 dwellings of masonry exterior construction ranging in size from 4,842 to 5,663 square feet of living area. The dwellings range in age from 12 to 28 years old. The comparables have partial or full basements, one of which has finished area. Each comparable has central air conditioning, two fireplaces and a 3-car garage. The comparables have improvement assessments ranging from \$68,451 to \$81,285 or from \$13.83 to \$14.87 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested the subject's assessment be confirmed.

## **Conclusion of Law**

The taxpayer contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The parties submitted eight suggested comparables for the Board's consideration. The Board gives less weight to the appellant's comparables #1, #3 and #4 and the board of review's comparable #3 due to their larger dwelling sizes and/or older ages when compared to the subject.

The Board finds the best evidence of assessment equity to be the parties' remaining comparables as they are relatively similar to the subject in location, design and/or class, exterior construction, age, and dwelling size with varying similarity in other features. These comparables have improvement assessments ranging from \$55,117 to \$76,157 or from \$10.71 to \$14.87 per square foot of living area. The subject's improvement assessment of \$64,485 or \$12.54 per square foot of living area falls within the range established by the best comparables in this record. After considering adjustments to the comparables for differences from the subject, the Board finds the appellant did not demonstrate with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement was inequitably assessed and a reduction in the subject's improvement assessment based on inequity is not warranted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

| 2            | 1. hom         |
|--------------|----------------|
|              | Chairman       |
| a de R       | Robert Stoffen |
| Member       | Member         |
| Dan De Kinin | Swah Bokley    |
| Member       | Member         |
| DISSENTING:  |                |
| DIDDLITHIO.  | <u> </u>       |

# **CERTIFICATION**

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

| Date: | August 24, 2021      |
|-------|----------------------|
|       | 14.1016              |
|       | Mand                 |
|       | CI I CI D . T A ID I |

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

#### **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

# PARTIES OF RECORD

## **AGENCY**

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

## **APPELLANT**

Boris Nulman, by attorney: Robert Rosenfeld Robert H. Rosenfeld and Associates, LLC 33 North Dearborn Street Suite 1850 Chicago, IL 60602

# **COUNTY**

Cook County Board of Review County Building, Room 601 118 North Clark Street Chicago, IL 60602