

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Husien Fattah
DOCKET NO.: 19-26994.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 09-14-414-032-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Husien Fattah, the appellant(s), by attorney Ibrahim Fattah, of Law Street, LLC in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$10,800 **IMPR.:** \$55,126 **TOTAL:** \$65,926

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2019 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a 20-year-old, two-story, single-family dwelling of masonry construction with 4,472 square feet of living area. Features of the home include: an unfinished full basement, central air conditioning, and a two-car garage. The property has a 12,000 square foot site and is located in Niles, Maine Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-08 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant's appeal is based on overvaluation. The appellant indicated in the residential appeal that they based the appeal on a recent sale. In support of this argument the appellant submitted evidence disclosing the subject property was purchased on October 16, 2018, for a price of \$499,900. The appellant submitted an MLS transaction sheet, a "Listing & Property History Report," the master statement, and answered the questions in Section IV of the residential appeal. When answering, "what this property sold due to a foreclosure action" the appellant

checked "yes" but then wrote "but transaction had elements of an arm's-length sale." Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to \$49,900.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$65,926. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$659,260 or \$147.42 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 10% assessments for a class 2 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance. In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on four comparable sales.

In rebuttal, the appellant submitted a letter arguing that the evidence submitted by the board of review should be given diminished weight and reiterated their argument that the recent sale was an arm's length transaction.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

First the Board examines the appellant's argument based on the recent sale. The Board finds that the sale of the subject in October 2018 for \$655,000 was a "compulsory sale." A "compulsory sale" is defined as:

(i) the sale of real estate for less than the amount owed to the mortgage lender or mortgagor, if the lender or mortgagor has agreed to the sale, commonly referred to as a "short sale" and (ii) the first sale of real estate owned by a financial institution as a result of a judgment of foreclosure, transfer pursuant to a deed in lieu of foreclosure, or consent judgment, occurring after the foreclosure proceeding is complete.

35 ILCS 200/1-23. The Board finds that the sale of the subject is a compulsory sale, in the form of a foreclosure, based on the parties' documentation and the appellant's own admission. The MLS document shows that the subject property was lender owned and the master statement showed that the seller was U.S. Bank National Association.

Real property in Illinois must be assessed at its fair cash value.

Illinois law requires that all real property be valued at its fair cash value, estimated at the price it would bring at a fair voluntary sale where the owner is ready, willing, and able to sell but not compelled to do so, and the buyer is likewise ready, willing, and able to buy, but is not forced to do so.

Bd. of Educ. of Meridian Cmty. Unit Sch. Dist. No. 223 v. Ill. Prop. Tax Appeal Bd., 2012 IL App (2d) 100068, ¶ 36 (citing Chrysler Corp. v. Ill. Prop. Tax Appeal Bd., 69 Ill.App.3d 207, 211 (2d Dist. 1979)). A compulsory sale is not an arm's length sale.

A compulsory sale, while not an arm's length sale, may still be reflective of a fair market value. The Board may look to the market value evidence submitted by the parties to determine whether the purchase price was at the subject's fair market value. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). Such evidence may consist of an appraisal or the sales of comparable properties. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c); see, Calumet Transfer, LLC v. Ill. Prop. Tax Appeal Bd., 401 Ill.App.3d 652, 655-56 (1st Dist. 2010) ("[The Board] allowed the [intervenor] to challenge the arm's-length nature of the transaction by offering evidence of comparable property sales. This was permissible under paragraph (4) of section 1910.65(c).") The appellant did not submit any comparable sales or an appraisal to corroborate their assertion that the sale price was indicative of the fair market value. Based on this record, the appellant failed to prove by a preponderance of the evidence that the recent sale price was the fair market value and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified on this basis.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

21. Fer	
	Chairman
a de R	Robert Stoffen
Member	Member
Dan De Kinin	Swan Bokley
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:	April 16, 2024
	111:10 16
	Man O
	Claula af tha Duananta Tan Anna 1 Danul

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Husien Fattah, by attorney: Ibrahim Fattah Law Street, LLC 4545 West Armitage Avenue Chicago, IL 60639

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review County Building, Room 601 118 North Clark Street Chicago, IL 60602