



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Carlos Rotman
DOCKET NO.: 19-07822.001-R-2
PARCEL NO.: 12-09-401-019

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Carlos Rotman, the appellant, by attorney Andrew J. Rukavina, of The Tax Appeal Company in Mundelein; and the Lake County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds **No Change** in the assessment of the property as established by the **Lake** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$468,712
IMPR.: \$157,724
TOTAL: \$626,436

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Lake County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2019 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a 1-story dwelling of wood siding exterior construction with 3,995 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 1959. Features of the home include a partial basement, central air conditioning, two fireplaces, a 1,222 square foot garage, and an inground swimming pool. The property has a 144,740 square foot lakefront site and is located in Lake Bluff, Shields Township, Lake County.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted information on four comparable sales presented on two similar grids. The comparables are located from 0.32 of a mile to 8.78 miles from the subject property and two comparables are located within the same assessment neighborhood code as the subject property. Three comparables are located in Lake Bluff and one comparable is located in Lake Forest. The parcels range in size from 75,700 to 182,350 square feet of land area and are improved with 1-

story, 1.5-story, or 2-story homes of brick, wood siding, or stone exterior construction ranging in size from 3,814 to 5,682 square feet of living area. The dwellings range in age from 14 to 57 years old. Three homes each have a full or partial basement, two of which have finished area. Each home has central air conditioning and one to four fireplaces. Three comparables each have a garage ranging in size from 476 to 1,553 square feet of building area. The comparables sold from March 2016 to October 2017 for prices ranging from \$840,000 to \$1,500,000 or from \$220.24 to \$263.99 per square foot of living area, including land.

Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to \$333,283 which would reflect a market value of \$999,949 or \$250.30 per square foot of living area, including land, at the statutory level of assessment of 33.33%.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$626,436. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$1,904,640 or \$476.76 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2019 three year average median level of assessment for Lake County of 32.89% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on five comparable sales, together with a listing sheet for each comparable and a Real Estate Transfer Declaration for comparable #5 . The comparables are located from 2.01 to 4.31 miles from the subject property. Four comparables are located in Lake Bluff and one comparable is located in Lake Forest. The parcels range in size from 60,760 to 258,930 square feet of land area and are improved with 1-story, 2-story, or 2.5-story homes of brick, wood siding, or wood siding and stone exterior construction ranging in size from 3,875 to 11,895 square feet of living area. The dwellings were built from 1915 to 2018 with comparable #2 described as having been rehabbed in 2010 and comparable #5 described as restored. Each home has a full or partial basement with finished area, central air conditioning, two to seven fireplaces, and one or two garages ranging in size from 484 to 1,296 square feet of building area. Comparable #2 has an inground swimming pool, clay tennis court, and an elevator. Comparable #3 has an inground swimming pool, a pool house, and an enclosed boathouse. The comparables sold from October 2016 to April 2020 for prices ranging from \$2,325,000 to \$3,500,000 or from \$233.29 to \$600.00 per square foot of living area, including land.

The board of review submitted a brief asserting that the subject property has frontage on Lake Michigan and is a wooded landscaped lot. The board of review argued that the appellant's comparables are not lakefront lots like the subject and none has an inground swimming pool like the subject. The board of review disclosed that the appellant's comparable #4 sold in January 2021 for \$3,155,000 after being updated. The board of review further contended that its comparables are similar to the subject in quality, condition, and location.

The board of review also submitted a copy of a decision of the Board following an agreement by the parties to an assessed valuation for the subject of \$665,522 for the 2017 tax year.

Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The record contains a total of ten comparable sales for the Board's consideration, including both the February 2017 and the January 2021 sales of the appellant's comparable #4. The Board gives less weight to the appellant's comparables, including both sales of the appellant's comparable #4, and the board of review's comparables #3 and #5, each of which sold more remote in time from the January 1, 2019 assessment date.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to the board of review's comparables #1, #2, and #4, which have varying degrees of similarity to the subject. These most similar comparables sold from April 2018 to October 2019 for prices ranging from \$2,325,000 to \$2,775,000 or from \$233.29 to \$600.00 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$1,904,640 or \$476.76 per square foot of living area, including land, which is below the range established by the best comparable sales in terms of total market value and within the range on a price per square foot basis, which the Board finds to be logical given the subject's age and dwelling size when compared to the best comparables in the record. Based on this evidence and after considering appropriate adjustments to the best comparables for differences when compared to the subject, the Board finds a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

Chairman



Member



Member



Member



Member

DISSENTING: _____

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: July 19, 2022



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois
Property Tax Appeal Board
William G. Stratton Building, Room 402
401 South Spring Street
Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Carlos Rotman, by attorney:
Andrew J. Rukavina
The Tax Appeal Company
28643 North Sky Crest Drive
Mundelein, IL 60060

COUNTY

Lake County Board of Review
Lake County Courthouse
18 North County Street, 7th Floor
Waukegan, IL 60085