

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Murugappan Ramanathan

DOCKET NO.: 19-05042.001-R-1 PARCEL NO.: 14-04-201-095

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Murugappan Ramanathan, the appellant, by attorney Ronald Kingsley of Lake County Real Estate Tax Appeal, LLC in Lake Forest, and the Lake County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *no change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Lake** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$33,952 **IMPR.:** \$143,386 **TOTAL:** \$177,338

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

## **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Lake County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2019 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

#### **Findings of Fact**

The subject property is improved with a two-story dwelling of frame construction with 2,966 square feet of living area. The dwelling was built in 2017. Features of the home include an unfinished basement, central air conditioning, one fireplace and an attached two-garage with 469 square feet of building area. The property has an 8,455 square foot site and is located in Hawthorn Woods, Ela Township, Lake County.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted information on seven comparable sales improved with two-story dwellings of frame construction ranging in size from 2,797 to 3,345 square feet of living area. The homes were built from 2015 to 2017. Each comparable has an unfinished basement, central air

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Although the appellant submitted a grid analysis containing eight comparables, the comparable located at 2 Andrew Lane (PIN 14-03-107-015) was included twice.

conditioning, and an attached garage ranging in size from 521 to 770 square feet of building area. Five comparables have one fireplace. The comparables are located in the same neighborhood as the subject property with sites ranging in size from 7,797 to 14,667 square feet of land area. The appellant's submission included copies of photographs depicting the subject dwelling and the comparables. The sales occurred from December 2017 to May 2019 for prices ranging from \$475,000 to \$581,358 or from \$147.29 to \$177.02 per square foot of living area, including land. The appellant requested the subject's assessment be reduced to \$164,102.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$177,338. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$539,185 or \$181.79 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2019 three-year average median level of assessment for Lake County of 32.89% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on five comparable sales improved with two-story dwellings of frame construction ranging in size from 2,719 to 3,180 square feet of living area. The homes were built from 2015 to 2018. Each comparable has an unfinished basement with one being a "look-out", central air conditioning, and an attached garage ranging in size from 521 to 704 square feet of building area. Two comparables have one fireplace. The comparables are located in the same neighborhood as the subject property with sites ranging in size from 7,148 to 11,339 square feet of land area. The board of review submission included copies of photographs depicting the subject dwelling and the comparables. The sales occurred from May 2018 to April 2019 for prices ranging from \$512,500 to \$579,635 or from \$177.94 to \$188.49 per square foot of living area, including land.

## **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The record contains twelve sales presented by the parties to support their respective positions. The comparables are relatively similar to the subject in location, land area, style, age, and features with the exception five comparables lack a fireplace that the subject has and eight comparables have a larger garage than the subject property. Photographs of the comparables provided by the parties disclose that appellant's comparables #7 (PIN 14-03-107-007) and #8 (PIN 14-04-201-141) and board of review comparables #1, #2 and #3 are not quite as similar to the subject in style as the remaining sales. The Board finds the best comparables to be appellant's comparables #1 through #5 and board of review comparables #3 and #5. These properties sold from December 2017 to May 2019 for prices ranging from \$475,000 to \$581,358 or from \$147.29 to \$182.28 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$539,185 or \$181.79 per square foot of living area, including land, which is within the range established by the best comparable sales in this record.

Based on this record the Board finds the assessment of the subject property as established by the board of review is correct and a reduction in the assessment is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

21. Fer	
	Chairman
	Sobot Stoffen
Member	Member
Dan Dikini	Swah Bokley
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	

## **CERTIFICATION**

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:	March 15, 2022
	14.1016
	Mand
	Clark of the December Town Association

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

## IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

### PARTIES OF RECORD

### **AGENCY**

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

### **APPELLANT**

Murugappan Ramanathan, by attorney: Ronald Kingsley Lake County Real Estate Tax Appeal, LLC 13975 W. Polo Trail Drive #201 Lake Forest, IL 60045

### **COUNTY**

Lake County Board of Review Lake County Courthouse 18 North County Street, 7th Floor Waukegan, IL 60085