

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Paul Carollo
DOCKET NO.: 19-05024.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 12-21-119-002

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Paul Carollo, the appellant, by attorney Ronald Kingsley, of Lake County Real Estate Tax Appeal, LLC in Lake Forest; and the Lake County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Lake** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$116,868 **IMPR.:** \$270,006 **TOTAL:** \$386,874

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

# **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Lake County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2019 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

#### **Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a two-story dwelling of wood siding exterior construction with 3,943 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 1887 and has an effective age of 1934. Features of the home include an unfinished basement, central air conditioning, three fireplaces and a 440 square foot garage. The property has a 12,400 square foot site and is located in Lake Bluff, Shields Township, Lake County.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted information on four comparables and Multiple Listing Service (MLS) sheets on comparables #2 and #3. The four comparable sales are located within 0.63 of a mile from the subject property. The comparables have sites that range in size from 12,070 to 20,730 square

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Property details for the appellant's comparables #2 and #3 were supplemented and/or corrected with information contained in the properties' respective MLS sheets.

feet of land area and are improved with two-story or three-story dwellings of wood siding exterior construction that range in size from 3,366 to 4,223 square feet of living area. The dwellings were built from 1890 to 1925 with comparables #2 and #3 having effective ages of 1950 and 1940, respectively. Each comparable has a basement, one with finished area, central air conditioning and two or three fireplaces. Comparables #1, #2 and #4 have a garage ranging in size from 528 to 570 square feet of building area, while comparable #3 has a 3-car garage. The properties sold in June and November 2018 for prices ranging from \$750,000 to \$1,200,000 or from \$216.45 to \$356.51 per square foot of living area, land included. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested the subject's assessment be reduced to \$323,294 which reflects a market value of \$969,979 or \$246.00 per square foot of living area, land included, when applying the statutory level of assessment of 33.33%.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$386,874. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$1,176,266 or \$298.32 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2019 three year average median level of assessment for Lake County of 32.89% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on three comparable sales located in the same assessment neighborhood code as the subject property. Board of review comparable #2 is the same property as the appellant's comparable #4. The comparables have sites that range in size from 6,250 to 19,970 square feet of land area and are improved with two-story dwellings of brick and stucco or wood siding exterior construction that range in size from 3,366 to 3,880 square feet of living area. The homes were built from 1882 to 1925 and comparables #1 and #3 have effective ages of 1944 and 1940, respectively. Each comparable has an unfinished basement, central air conditioning, two or three fireplaces and a garage ranging in size from 570 to 624 square feet of building area. The properties sold from June 2018 to September 2019 for prices ranging from \$1,200,000 to \$1,750,000 or from \$356.51 to \$491.99 per square foot of living area, land included. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested the subject's assessment be confirmed.

#### **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The record contains six unique comparable sales for the Board's consideration, as one comparable was common to both parties. The Board gives less weight to the appellant's comparables #1, #3 and #4/board of review comparable #2 which differ from the subject in design, effective age and/or finished basement.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the remaining comparables which are more similar to the subject in location, effective age, design, dwelling size and features. These

comparables sold from June 2018 to September 2019 for prices ranging from \$949,500 to \$1,750,000 or from \$250.92 to \$491.99 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$1,176,266 or \$298.32 per square foot of living area, including land, which falls within the range established by the best comparable sales in this record. After considering adjustments to the comparables for differences from the subject, the Board finds a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

21. Fer	
Chair	rman
C. R.	Robert Stoffen
Member	Member
Dan De Kinin	Swan Bokley
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	

# **CERTIFICATION**

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:	March 15, 2022	
	Middle 14	
	Clerk of the Property Tay Appeal Roard	

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

# **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

## PARTIES OF RECORD

## **AGENCY**

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

## **APPELLANT**

Paul Carollo, by attorney: Ronald Kingsley Lake County Real Estate Tax Appeal, LLC 13975 W. Polo Trail Drive #201 Lake Forest, IL 60045

## **COUNTY**

Lake County Board of Review Lake County Courthouse 18 North County Street, 7th Floor Waukegan, IL 60085