

## FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT:	Laurie Rose
DOCKET NO .:	19-04623.001-R-1
PARCEL NO .:	16-08-107-010

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Laurie Rose, the appellant, by attorney Ronald Kingsley of Lake County Real Estate Tax Appeal, LLC in Lake Forest; and the Lake County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *a reduction* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Lake** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND:	\$174,874
IMPR.:	\$250,126
TOTAL:	\$425,000

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

#### **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Lake County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2019 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

#### **Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a 2-story dwelling of brick exterior construction with 5,782 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 1988. Features of the home include a basement finished with a recreation room, central air conditioning, two fireplaces and a 1,000 square foot garage. The property also has an 800 square foot inground swimming pool. The property has a 60,110 square foot site and is located in Lake Forest, West Deerfield Township, Lake County.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted information on twelve comparable sales.<sup>1</sup> All of the comparables are located

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The appellant provided a grid analysis of the subject and ten comparable sales, as well as Multiple Listing Service (MLS) data sheets associated with the sales of appellant's comparables #2, #3, #7 and #10. The appellant also provided MLS data sheets associated with the sales of two additional properties located in Lake Forest. The parcel

in Lake Forest with the ten gridded comparables being located from .34 to 1.17 miles from the subject property. The twelve comparables have sites that range in size from 18,500 to 75,790 square feet of land area. The comparables are improved with 1-story, 1.5-story and 2-story dwellings of brick, wood siding, cedar or brick and wood siding exterior construction ranging in size from 4,676 to 6,919 square feet of living area. The dwellings were built from 1984 to 1993. The appellant reported that each comparable has a basement, nine of which have recreation rooms.<sup>2</sup> Each comparable has central air conditioning, one to three fireplaces and a garage. The appellant reported that the ten gridded comparables each have a garage ranging in size from 612 to 1,506 square feet of building area and the MLS data sheets revealed that comparables #11 and #12 each have a three-car garage. Five comparables have inground swimming pools, one of which also has a bath house. The properties sold from January 2018 to July 2019 for prices ranging from \$725,000 to \$1,290,000 or from \$145.17 to \$239.68 per square foot of living area, including land.

Counsel for the appellant asserted that there were no sales with similar square footage in the subject's neighborhood. The appellant's counsel noted differences between the comparables and the subject. Counsel argued that sale prices in the large McMansions have been declining therefore, a reduction to the subject's assessment is requested.

Based on this evidence, the appellant requested the subject's assessment be reduced to \$395,064, which would reflect a market value of \$1,185,311 or \$205.00 per square foot of living area, including land, when using the statutory level of assessment of 33.33%.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$440,289. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$1,338,671 or \$231.52 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2019 threeyear average median level of assessment for Lake County of 32.89% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on three comparable sales located in Lake Forest and within .42 of a mile from the subject property. The board of review's comparable #2 is the same property as the appellant's comparable #10. The comparables have site sizes that range in size from 60,110 to 75,360 square feet of land area. The comparables are improved with 2-story dwellings of brick or wood siding exterior construction ranging in size from 4,845 to 6,881 square feet of living area. The dwellings were built from 1989 to 1992. Each comparable has a basement finished with a recreation room, central air conditioning, one to three fireplaces and a garage ranging in size from 864 to 1,250 square feet of building area. Board of review comparable #2 has an inground swimming pool. The properties sold in June 2018 and June 2019 for prices ranging from \$1,290,000 to \$1,772,500 or from \$220.55 to 283.80 per square foot of living area, including

numbers associated with these properties are shown as 16-08-202-018 and 16-07-406-013, which have been numbered by the Board as comparables #11 and #12, respectively.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The MLS data sheets revealed that the appellant's comparables #2, #3, #7, #11 and #12 all have basements finished with recreation rooms. Additionally, the appellant's comparable #10 has a second kitchen in its basement and the appellant's comparable #12 has a theater room and in-law arrangement included in its basement. The board of review did not refute these claims in rebuttal evidence.

land. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

#### **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The record contains 14 suggested comparable sales for the Board's consideration, as one property was common to both parties. The Board has given less weight to the appellant's comparables #1, #2, #4, #6, #8, #9 and #12, as well as board of review comparables #1 and #3 due to their dissimilar dwelling sizes when compared to the subject. The Board has also given less weight to the appellant's comparable #5 due to its significantly smaller site size when compared to the subject and to appellant's comparable #7 due to its dissimilar 1-story design when compared to the subject's 2-story design.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the appellant's comparables #3, #10 and #11, which includes the parties' common sale. The Board finds these three comparables are relatively similar to the subject in location, site size, dwelling size, design, age and some features. The comparables sold from October 2018 to June 2019 for prices ranging from \$930,000 to \$1,290,000 or from \$161.94 and \$228.28 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$1,338,671 or \$231.52 per square foot of living area, including land, which falls above the range established by the best comparable sales in the record both in terms of overall market value and on a price per square foot basis. After considering adjustments to the comparables for differences when compared to the subject, the Board finds the subject's estimated market value as reflected by its assessment is excessive. Therefore, based on this record the Board finds a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

Chairman Member Member Member Member **DISSENTING:** 

# <u>CERTIFICATION</u>

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:

July 19, 2022

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

#### **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND</u> <u>EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

## PARTIES OF RECORD

## AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

#### APPELLANT

Laurie Rose, by attorney: Ronald Kingsley Lake County Real Estate Tax Appeal, LLC 13975 W. Polo Trail Drive #201 Lake Forest, IL 60045

#### COUNTY

Lake County Board of Review Lake County Courthouse 18 North County Street, 7th Floor Waukegan, IL 60085