

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

| APPELLANT: | Manindra Singh |
|--------------|------------------|
| DOCKET NO.: | 19-03204.001-R-1 |
| PARCEL NO .: | 08-19-219-007 |

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Manindra Singh, the appellant, by Dennis D. Koonce, Attorney at Law in Frankfort; and the DuPage County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *a reduction* in the assessment of the property as established by the **DuPage** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

| LAND: | \$142,020 |
|--------|-----------|
| IMPR.: | \$130,150 |
| TOTAL: | \$272,170 |

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the DuPage County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2019 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a part two-story and part one-story dwelling of frame exterior construction with 4,119 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 2002. Features of the home include an unfinished basement, central air conditioning, two fireplaces and a three-car garage with 583 square feet of building area. The property has a 20,292 square foot site and is located in Naperville, Lisle Township, DuPage County.

The appellant's appeal is based on overvaluation. In support of this argument, the appellant completed Section IV – Recent Sale Data of the appeal petition and submitted evidence disclosing the subject property was purchased on May 16, 2019 for a price of \$825,000. The appellant identified the seller as Leonard Sherman and indicated the parties were not related. The appellant further disclosed the property was sold by a realtor and the property had been advertised in the Multiple Listing Service (MLS) for a period of 105 days. To document the transaction the appellant submitted a copy of the MLS listing sheet and a copy of the settlement

PTAB/JLG/12-21

statement reiterating the sale date and price which also depicted commissions being issued to two realty agencies as part of the transaction. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to reflect the purchase price.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$299,730. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$908,548 or \$220.57 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2019 three-year average median level of assessment for DuPage County of 32.99% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review, through the township assessor, submitted information on three comparable sales located from .12 to .39 of a mile from the subject property. The comparables have sites that range in size from 8,484 to 8,966 square feet of land area. The comparables are improved with a two-story dwelling and two, part two-story and part one-story dwellings of frame exterior construction that range in size from 3,815 to 4,177 square feet of living area. The dwellings were built from 2004 to 2007. The dwellings each have a basement, two of which have finished area. Each comparable has central air conditioning, two or three fireplaces and a garage that ranges in size from 648 to 701 square feet of building area. The comparables sold from April to August 2018 for prices ranging from \$920,000 to \$970,000 or from \$220.25 to \$254.26 per square foot of living area, including land. A map depicting the locations of the comparables in relation to the subject's assessment.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the purchase of the subject property in May 2019 for a price of \$825,000. The appellant provided evidence demonstrating the sale had the elements of an arm's length transaction. The appellant completed Section IV - Recent Sale Data of the appeal disclosing the parties to the transaction were not related, the property was sold using a realtor, the property had been advertised on the open market in the Multiple Listing Service and it had been on the market for 105 days. In further support of the transaction the appellant submitted a copy of the settlement statement and the MLS listing sheet. The Board finds the board of review did not present any evidence to challenge the arm's length nature of the transaction or to refute the contention that the purchase price was reflective of market value. Furthermore, the Board has given less weight to the board of review comparable sales as they do not overcome the apparent arm's length nature of the subject's recent sale transaction. Based on this record the Board finds the subject property had a market value of \$825,000 as of January 1, 2019. Since market value has been determined the 2019 three-year average median level of assessment for DuPage County of 32.99% shall apply. 86 Ill.Admin.Code \$1910.50(c)(1).

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

Chairman Member Member Member Member **DISSENTING:**

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:

December 21, 2021

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND</u> <u>EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Manindra Singh, by attorney: Dennis D. Koonce Attorney at Law 11255 Patrick Court Frankfort, IL 60423

COUNTY

DuPage County Board of Review DuPage Center 421 N. County Farm Road Wheaton, IL 60187