

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Bertha & Ricardo Garcia

DOCKET NO.: 18-30305.001-R-1 PARCEL NO.: 14-29-425-044-1002

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Bertha & Ricardo Garcia, the appellant(s), by attorney Brian P. Liston, of the Law Offices of Liston & Tsantilis, P.C. in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$7,776 **IMPR.:** \$35,892 **TOTAL:** \$43,668

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

#### **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2018 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

## **Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a condominium unit within a 19-year old, multi-story, masonry, four-unit condominium building. The property is located in Chicago, Lake View Township, Cook County and is classified as a class 2-99 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant's appeal is based on overvaluation. In support of the overvaluation argument, the appellant submitted evidence of the sale of three units located within the subject's building. These units sold from October 2015 to May 2018 for a sale amount from \$365,000 to \$575,000. The appellant argues that the sale price should be reduced by 7% to account for personal property. The appellant then argues that, based on a sales ratio study of the sales prices compared to their assessments, these units and the subject unit are over assessed.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the subject's assessment of \$43,668. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$436,680 when using the level of assessment for class 2 property of 10% under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted the sales data on the sale of three units within the building. These same sales were submitted by the appellant and sold for a total of \$1,496,700. The board of review applied a 5% factor to this value for an adjusted sales amount of \$1,421,865. The board of review then applied the percentage of ownership of the units sold of 76% to arrive at a value for the building of \$1,870,875.

# **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c).

As to the appellant's sales ratio study argument, the appellant provided sales information for three properties located within the subject's building. The Board finds this sales study insufficient and gives it little weight. The Board finds the appellant did not choose random properties to analyze sales information, but instead chose only properties located within the subject's building. The Court has stated that when comparable properties are handpicked and not random, the study cannot be viewed as representative of the county's assessments as a whole. Peacock v. Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board, 339 Ill.App.3d 1060, 1069, 792 N.E.2d 367, 374 (4th Dist. 2003).

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the sales submitted by both parties. However, the Board gives no weight to the board of review's and the appellant's adjustment for personal property as there is no evidence of this in the record. The percentage of ownership of the units sold of 76% reflects a value for the building of \$1,969,342. Applying the percentage of ownership of the subject property of 24% results in a value for the subject of \$472,642. In applying the level of assessment for class 2 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance of 10%, the Board finds the appellant failed to show by a preponderance of the evidence that the subject property was overvalued, and a reduction is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

21. Fer	
	Chairman
a de R	Robert Stoffen
Member	Member
Dan De Kinin	Swan Bokley
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	

## **CERTIFICATION**

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:	October 19, 2021
	111.1016
	Mano
	Clade of the Donnertee Tree Association of

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

#### **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

# PARTIES OF RECORD

## **AGENCY**

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

## **APPELLANT**

Bertha & Ricardo Garcia, by attorney: Brian P. Liston Law Offices of Liston & Tsantilis, P.C. 33 North LaSalle Street 28th Floor Chicago, IL 60602

# **COUNTY**

Cook County Board of Review County Building, Room 601 118 North Clark Street Chicago, IL 60602