

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Matthew Aldakka
DOCKET NO.: 18-23244.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 08-14-401-126-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Matthew Aldakka, the appellant(s), by attorney Herbert B. Rosenberg, of Schoenberg Finkel Beederman Bell Glazer, LLC in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds <u>A Reduction</u> in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$1,469 **IMPR.:** \$34,506 **TOTAL:** \$35,975

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

## **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2018 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

#### **Findings of Fact**

The subject property is improved with a 40-year-old, two-story, building of masonry construction containing 5,067 square feet of gross building area. Features of the subject include slab foundation. The subject is contained in a residential development known as Knights of Huntington Homeowners Association (Association). The property is situated on 2,672 square feet of land in Elk Grove Township, Cook County. The subject is a Class 2 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted information on 12 suggested equity comparable properties. The appellant argued it selected suggested comparable properties that were not in the same

residential association as the subject. The appellant cited <u>Pace Realty Group, Inc. v. Property Tax Appeal Board</u>, 306 Ill.App.3d 718 (2<sup>nd</sup> Dist. 1999), in support of the proposition that it would be inappropriate for the Board to consider as evidence properties that are comparable to the subject where they are in the same development as the subject and have the same assessment as the subject.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$50,441. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$48,972, or \$9.66 per square foot of gross building area. In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on four suggested equity comparable properties.

In rebuttal, the appellant argued that the comparable properties submitted as evidence by the board of review should be given diminished weight because they were selected from properties in the Association that have the same assessment as the subject and that were being appealed to the Board. The appellant cited Pace, *supra*, as legal authority. The appellant reaffirmed the request for an assessment reduction.

## **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparable properties to the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b). The Board finds the appellant met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The Board gives no weight to the four suggested comparable properties cited by the board of review, as they are in the same Association as the subject and received the same assessment. The Board is guided by the Appellate Court decision in <u>Pace</u>, *supra*, that in that case, the Board erred "as a matter of law when it selects as a comparable a parcel of property which has also received the same contested assessment. Conducting uniformity analysis in such a manner will lead to absurd results and will render the assessment appeal process meaningless." <u>Pace</u>, *supra*, at 728.

The Board finds the best evidence of assessment equity to be the appellant's comparable(s) #7 through #9. These comparable properties were most similar with the subject and had improvement assessments that ranged from \$6.70 to \$6.81 per square foot of living area. The subject's improvement assessment of \$9.66 per square foot of gross building area falls above the range established by the best comparable properties in this record. The Board notes that, despite citing Pace, the appellant submitted three suggested comparable properties from the Association. The Board give these no weight. Based on this record, the Board finds the appellant

demonstrated with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement was inequitably assessed and holds that a reduction in the subject's assessment is justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

21. Fem	
C	hairman
R	Astort Stoffen
Member	Member
Dan Dikini	Sarah Schler
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	
<u>CERTIFICATION</u>	
As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the	

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: December 21, 2021

Millold

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

**IMPORTANT NOTICE** 

# Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

# PARTIES OF RECORD

#### **AGENCY**

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

#### **APPELLANT**

Matthew Aldakka, by attorney: Herbert B. Rosenberg Schoenberg Finkel Beederman Bell Glazer, LLC 300 South Wacker Drive Suite 1500 Chicago, IL 60606

# **COUNTY**

Cook County Board of Review County Building, Room 601 118 North Clark Street Chicago, IL 60602