

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Matthew Mata

DOCKET NO.: 17-46627.001-R-1 through 17-46627.002-R-1

PARCEL NO.: See Below

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Matthew Mata, the appellant(s), by attorney Abby L. Strauss, of Schiller Law P.C. in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds <u>A Reduction</u> in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

DOCKET NO	PARCEL NUMBER	LAND	IMPRVMT	TOTAL
17-46627.001-R-1	16-24-302-017-0000	3,209	0	\$ 3,209
17-46627.002-R-1	16-24-302-018-0000	3,906	12,885	\$ 16,791

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal pursuant to section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-185) after receiving a favorable decision from the Property Tax Appeal Board (the "Board") in the prior year. The instant appeal challenges the assessment for tax year 2017. The Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of this appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject consists of a two-story dwelling of masonry construction with 2,764 square feet of living area. The dwelling is 108 years old. Features of the home include a full basement with a formal recreation room and a two-car garage. The property's site is 7,476 square feet, and it is located in West Chicago Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-11 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted evidence disclosing the subject property was purchased on November 18, 2016 for a price of \$165,000.

The subject property was the subject matter of an appeal before the Board in 2016 under docket number 16-38850. In that appeal, the Board rendered a decision lowering the subject's

assessment to \$20,000. The appellant requests that the subject's assessment for tax year 2016 as determined by the Board be carried forward to the instant tax year of 2017 based on section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to \$20,000.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing that the total assessment for the subject is \$24,578. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$245,780, or \$88.92 per square foot of living area, including land, when applying the 2017 statutory level of assessment for class 2 property of 10.00% under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on four equity comparables, and one sale comparable. This sale comparable sold in November 2016 for \$, or \$ per square foot of living area, including land. The board of review's evidence also states that the subject was purchased in September 2016 for \$138,531.

In rebuttal, the appellant reaffirmed the evidence previously submitted.

Conclusion of Law

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides, in relevant part:

If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel on which a residence occupied by the owner is situated, such reduced assessment, subject to equalization, shall remain in effect for the remainder of the general assessment period as provided in Sections 9-215 through 9-225, unless that parcel is subsequently sold in an arm's length transaction establishing a fair cash value for the parcel that is different from the fair cash value on which the Board's assessment is based, or unless the decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board is reversed or modified upon review.

35 ILCS 200/16-185. Additionally, "Standard of proof. Unless otherwise provided by law or stated in the agency's rules, the standard of proof in any contested case hearing conducted under this Act by an agency shall be the preponderance of the evidence." 5 ILCS 100/10-15. The Board finds that there is no evidence in the record to show that the subject is owner-occupied. Thus, the Board finds that the appellant has not proven, by a preponderance of the evidence, that the subject is owner-occupied. For these reasons, the Board finds that the subject's 2016 assessment cannot be carried forward to the instant tax year of 2017 pursuant to section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code, and that a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal, the value of the property must be proven by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales, or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did meet this burden of proof, and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the purchase of the subject in November 2016 for a price of \$165,000. The appellant provided evidence demonstrating that the sale had the elements of an arm's-length transaction, including disclosing that the parties to the transaction were not related and the property was advertised for sale on the open market with a listing on the MLS for approximately 26 days. In further support of the transaction, the appellant submitted the printout from the MLS and the settlement statement. The Board finds the purchase price is below the market value reflected by the assessment. Based on this record, the Board finds that the appellant has proven, by a preponderance of the evidence, that the subject is overvalued. The Board finds the subject property had a market value of \$165,000 as of January 1, 2017, and that a reduction in the subject's assessment to the assessment requested by the appellant is warranted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

2	1. Fer
	Chairman
C. R.	Robert Stoffen
Member	Member
Dan De Kinin	
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

1111216	
My man Com	
	Middle 15

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

Docket No: 17-46627.001-R-1 through 17-46627.002-R-1

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Matthew Mata, by attorney: Abby L. Strauss Schiller Law P.C. 33 North Dearborn Suite 1130 Chicago, IL 60602

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review County Building, Room 601 118 North Clark Street Chicago, IL 60602