



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Reyad & Wafa Shalabi
DOCKET NO.: 17-34498.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 27-24-407-018-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Reyad & Wafa Shalabi, the appellants, by attorney Scott L. David, of Much Shelist, in Chicago, and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds **No Change** in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$ 2,362
IMPR.: \$15,917
TOTAL: \$18,279

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellants timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2017 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a one-story dwelling of frame exterior construction with 1,084 square feet of living area. The dwelling is approximately 46 years old. Features of the home include a concrete slab foundation, central air conditioning and a one-car garage. The property has a 6,300 square foot site and is located in Tinley Park, Orland Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-03 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellants originally filed an appeal marking the basis of appeal as recent appraisal along with a request for an extension of time to submit evidence. The appellants' subsequent submission of evidence lacked the necessary basis of appeal (35 ILCS 200/16-180; 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.30(j)) but provided a brief along with four comparable properties with equity data, each of which have dated sales information. In the absence of sufficient recent

market value evidence to assert overvaluation of the subject property (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c)(4)), the Board will analyze this appeal based on the brief and evidence wherein the appellants imply assessment inequity as the basis of this appeal.

In support of the inequity argument the appellants submitted information on four comparables located in the same neighborhood code as the subject. The comparables consist of one-story class 2-03 dwellings of frame and masonry exterior construction. The homes are each 46 years old and contain either 1,719 or 1,740 square feet of living area. Each comparable has a crawl-space foundation. Two dwellings each have central air conditioning and one comparable has a fireplace. Each comparable has a two-car garage. The comparables have improvement assessments ranging from \$18,080 to \$18,264 or from \$10.39 to \$10.62 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the appellants as set forth in the Residential Appeal petition requested a reduced improvement assessment of \$7,638 or \$7.05 per square foot of living area.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$18,279. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$15,917 or \$14.68 per square foot of living area.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on four equity comparables located in the same neighborhood code as the subject property and either in the same block or within ¼ of a mile of the subject. The comparables consist of one-story class 2-03 dwellings of frame exterior construction. The homes are either 44 or 46 years old and contain either 1,064 or 1,120 square feet of living area. Three comparables have either full or partial basements, one of which has a formal recreation room and one comparable has a slab foundation. Two dwellings each have central air conditioning. Each comparable has a two-car garage. The comparables have improvement assessments ranging from \$16,587 to \$18,843 or from \$15.48 to \$16.82 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

Conclusion of Law

The taxpayers contend assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b). The Board finds the appellants did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The parties submitted a total of eight comparable properties to support their respective positions before the Property Tax Appeal Board. The only comparable truly similar to the subject dwelling is board of review comparable #3, although this dwelling lacks central air conditioning which is a feature of the subject and has a two-car garage whereas the subject property has only a one-car garage. The appellants' comparables are each dissimilar to the subject dwelling by being significantly larger than the subject's 1,084 square feet of living area.

Nevertheless, on this record, the Board finds the best evidence of assessment equity to be the board of review comparables, acknowledging that board of review comparables #1, #2 and #4 have superior full or partial basements as compared to the subject's concrete slab foundation. These comparables had improvement assessments that ranged from \$16,587 to \$18,843 or from \$15.48 to \$16.82 per square foot of living area. The subject's improvement assessment of \$15,917 or \$14.68 per square foot of living area falls below the range established by the best comparables in this record and appears to be well-supported by the best comparables in the record, board of review comparable #3. Based on this limited record, the Board finds the appellants did not demonstrate with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement was inequitably assessed and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.



Chairman



Member



Member



Member



Member

DISSENTING: _____

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:

July 20, 2021



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois
Property Tax Appeal Board
William G. Stratton Building, Room 402
401 South Spring Street
Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Reyad & Wafa Shalabi, by attorney:
Scott L. David
Much Shelist
191 North Wacker Drive
Suite 1800
Chicago, IL 60606-1615

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review
County Building, Room 601
118 North Clark Street
Chicago, IL 60602