

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT:Harry DulaneyDOCKET NO.:17-32300.001-R-1 through 17-32300.002-R-1PARCEL NO.:See Below

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Harry Dulaney, the appellant(s); and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds <u>No Change</u> in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

DOCKET NO	PARCEL NUMBER	LAND	IMPRVMT	TOTAL
17-32300.001-R-1	03-08-400-057-0000	7,226	60,746	\$67,972
17-32300.002-R-1	03-08-400-058-0000	6,703	26,034	\$32,737

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2017 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of two parcels of land situated on a 63,641 square foot lot. The subject contains a two-story dwelling of frame and masonry construction containing 5,472 square feet of living area. The property is located in Wheeling Township, Cook County and is classified as a class 2 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted information on one comparable sale. The appellant also submitted information on five listings located in various neighborhood, none of which are the same as the subject property. The sale comparable sold on October 20, 2017 and sold for \$700,000, or \$136.27 per square foot of living area and is located in a different neighborhood as the subject and 3.8 miles from the subject. The appellant also included color photographs of the subject and the properties submitted.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$100,709. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$1,007,090, or \$184.04 including land, when applying the level of assessment for class 2 properties of 10.00% as determined by the Cook County classification ordinance.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on four sale comparables. Two of the comparables are located in the same neighborhood as the subject. The board of review also submitted a brief stating that the subject was sold in a foreclosure and submitted a deed trail showing a lis pendens was placed on the subject on August 25, 2009 and granted from Bank America to Louis Alvarez and later deeded to the appellant on September 19, 2012 by Bank America.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The Board finds that the sale of the subject in September 2012 was a "compulsory sale." A "compulsory sale" is defined as:

(i) the sale of real estate for less than the amount owed to the mortgage lender or mortgagor, if the lender or mortgagor has agreed to the sale, commonly referred to as a "short sale" and (ii) the first sale of real estate owned by a financial institution as a result of a judgment of foreclosure, transfer pursuant to a deed in lieu of foreclosure, or consent judgment, occurring after the foreclosure proceeding is complete. 35 ILCS 200/1-23.

Real property in Illinois must be assessed at its fair cash value, which can only be estimated absent any compulsion on either party. Illinois law requires that all real property be valued at its fair cash value, estimated at the price it would bring at a fair voluntary sale where the owner is ready, willing, and able to sell but not compelled to do so, and the buyer is likewise ready, willing, and able to buy, but is not forced to do so. <u>Bd. of Educ. of Meridian Cmty. Unit Sch.</u> <u>Dist. No. 223 v. Ill. Prop. Tax Appeal Bd.</u>, 2011 IL App (2d) 100068, ¶ 36 (citing <u>Chrysler Corp. v. Ill. Prop. Tax Appeal Bd.</u>, 69 Ill.App.3d 207, 211 (2d Dist. 1979)).

However, when there is a recent sale of the subject, and that sale is a compulsory sale, the Board may consider evidence which would show whether the sale price was representative of the subject's fair cash value. See 35 ILCS 200/16-183 ("The Property Tax Appeal Board shall consider compulsory sales of comparable properties for the purpose of revising and correcting assessments, including those compulsory sales of comparable properties submitted by the taxpayer."). Such evidence can include the descriptive and sales information for recently sold properties that are similar to the subject. See Id.

In the instant appeal, the parties submitted a total of five sale comparables but only comparables #1 and #4 from the board of review are located in the same neighborhood as the subject. The board of review's comparables #1 and #4 are most similar to the subject and sold on May 1, 2015 for \$1,200,000, or \$203.63 per square foot of living area and for \$970,000, or \$221.01 per square foot of living area. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$184.04 per square foot of living area, including land, and sold for less than the best comparable sales in this record. The subject's sale price of \$576,000, or \$105.26 per square foot of living area, including land is below the range established by the market data.

In determining the fair cash value of the subject property and all relevant factors, the Board finds that the appellant did not submit sufficient evidence to show the subject was overvalued. Therefore, the Board finds that the appellant has not met its burden by a preponderance of the evidence and that the subject does not warrant a reduction based upon the market data submitted into evidence.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

	Chairman
22. Fer	ChR -
Member	Member
Solort Stoffer	Dan Dikinin
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:

October 15, 2019

Mano Allorino

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND</u> <u>EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Harry Dulaney 2803 N Elm Lane Arlington Heights, IL 60004

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review County Building, Room 601 118 North Clark Street Chicago, IL 60602