

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Asmahan Baker (Ibrahim)

DOCKET NO.: 17-27589.001-R-1 PARCEL NO.: 19-30-304-058-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Asmahan Baker (Ibrahim), the appellant(s); and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$3,691 **IMPR.:** \$23,222 **TOTAL:** \$26,913

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

## **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

# **Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a 4,922 square foot parcel of land improved with a 10-year old, masonry, single-family dwelling containing approximately 2,055 square feet of building area. The property is located in Stickney Township, Cook County and is classified as a class 2 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant contends overvaluation and inequity as the bases of the appeal. In support of these arguments, the appellant submitted information on four comparables. These properties are described as two-story or multi-level, masonry or frame and masonry, single-family dwellings. They range: in age from 28 to 49 years; in size from 1,187 to 2,140 square feet of building area; and in improvement assessment from \$8.60 to \$11.70 per square foot of building area. These comparables sold from August 2016 to January 2018 for prices ranging from \$79.44 to \$197.98 per square foot of building area.

In addition, the appellant asserts the subject is a split-level dwelling. The appellant included a black and white photograph of the subject and the comparables.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$26,913 with an improvement assessment of \$23,222 or \$11.30 per square foot of building area. The subject's total assessment reflects a market value of \$269,130 or \$130.96 per square foot of building area when using the level of assessment for class 2 property of 10% under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted four comparables with market value data on three of these comparables. These properties are described as two-story or multi-level, masonry or frame and masonry, single-family dwellings. They range: in age from 10 to 16 years; in size from 1,729 to 2,003 square feet of building area; and in improvement assessment from \$12.00 to \$18.71 per square foot of building area. Three of these comparables sold from June 2014 to February 2017 for prices ranging from \$140.79 to \$202.43 per square foot of building area. The board of review lists the subject as a two-story dwelling and included a photograph of the subject.

## **Conclusion of Law**

As to the subject's design type, the Board finds subject is a two-story dwelling. Both the appellant's and the board of review submitted photographs which depict the same property: a two-story, masonry, single-family dwelling.

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c).

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the appellant's comparable #1 and the board of review's comparables #2 and #4. These comparables sold from April 2016 to November 2017 for prices ranging from \$79.44 to \$202.43 per square foot of building area. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$130.96 per square foot of building area which is within the range of the best comparables in the record. Based on the record and after adjustments to the comparables, the Board finds the appellant did not demonstrate by a preponderance of the evidence that the subject was overvalued, and a reduction is not justified.

The taxpayer also contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b).

The Board finds the best evidence of assessment equity to be the appellant's comparable #1and the board of review's comparables. These comparables had improvement assessments ranging from \$8.59 to \$18.71 per square foot of building area. The subject's improvement assessment of \$11.30 per square foot of building area is within the range of the best comparables in this record. Based on this record the Board finds the appellant did not demonstrate with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement was inequitably assessed and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

said office.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

	Chairman
21. Fer	a R
Member	Member
asort Stoffen	Dan De Kinin
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	
DISSENTING.	
<u>C E R T I</u>	FICATION
	l Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do ll and complete Final Administrative Decision of the

Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

Mauro Illorias

May 21, 2019

#### **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Date:

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

## PARTIES OF RECORD

## **AGENCY**

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

## **APPELLANT**

Asmahan Baker (Ibrahim) 7723 S. Newcastle Ave. Burbank, IL 60459

## **COUNTY**

Cook County Board of Review County Building, Room 601 118 North Clark Street Chicago, IL 60602