

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Kimberly Dsida DOCKET NO.: 17-23153.001-R-1 PARCEL NO.: 05-21-112-004-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Kimberly Dsida, the appellant, by attorney Robert Rosenfeld, of Robert H. Rosenfeld and Associates, LLC in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$23,868 IMPR.: \$82,688 TOTAL: \$106,556

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2017 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a two-story dwelling of frame exterior construction with 3,578 square feet of living area. The dwelling is approximately 104 years old. Features of the home include a full finished basement, central air conditioning, a fireplace, and a three-car garage. The property has a 12,240 square foot site and is located in Winnetka, New Trier Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-06 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.¹

The appellant contends assessment inequity with respect to the improvement as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted information on three equity comparables that are located within the same neighborhood code as the subject. The

¹ The Board finds the only evidence of the subject's property description was provided within the appellant's evidence.

comparables are improved with class 2-06 dwellings of frame exterior construction containing from 3,862 to 4,998 square feet of living area. The dwellings range in age from 103 to 160 years old and have partial or full unfinished basements. The comparables have central air conditioning, one or two fireplaces, and a two-car or a three-car garage. The comparables have improvement assessments ranging from \$79,596 to \$104,458 or from \$20.61 to \$21.88 per square foot of living area.

Based on this evidence, the appellant requested that the subject's improvement assessment be reduced to \$75,603 or \$21.13 per square foot of living area.

The appellant's submission revealed that the subject has an improvement assessment of \$82,688, which equates to \$23.11 per square foot of living area.

The board of review did not timely submit any evidence in support of the assessment of the subject property or to refute the appellant's argument as required by section 1910.40(a) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board and is found to be in default pursuant to section 1910.69(a) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board. (86 Ill.Admin.Code 1910.40(a) & 1910.69(a)).

Conclusion of Law

The taxpayer contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The Board finds the board of review did not submit any evidence in support of its assessment of the subject property or to refute the evidence submitted by the appellant as required by Section1910.40(a) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board and is in default pursuant to Section 1910.69(a) of the rules of the Board. (86 III.Admin.Code §1910.40(a); 1910.69(a)). The Board further finds none of the comparables submitted by the appellant are particularly similar to the subject with differences in their older age, larger dwelling sizes, and/or dissimilar unfinished basements. The appellant's comparables have improvement assessments ranging from \$79,596 to \$104,458 or from \$20.61 to \$21.88 per square foot of living area. The subject's improvement assessment of \$82,688 or \$23.11 falls within the range established by these comparables with its improvement assessment and above the range on a per-square-foot basis. After adjusting the comparables for differences when compared to the subject, the Board further finds the appellant did not demonstrate with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement was inequitably assessed and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

The constitutional provision for uniformity of taxation and valuation does not require mathematical equality. A practical uniformity, rather than an absolute one, is the test. Apex Motor Fuel Co. v. Barrett, 20 Ill.2d 395 (1960). Although the comparables presented by the

parties disclosed that the properties located in the same area are not assessed at identical levels, all that the constitution requires is a practical uniformity, which appears to exist on the basis of the evidence presented.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

2	1. Fem
·	Chairman
a R	asort Stoffen
Member	Member
Dan Dikini	Sarah Bokley
Member	Member
DISSENTING: <u>CER</u>	<u>TIFICATION</u>
As Clark of the Illinois Property Toy Apr	seal Roard and the keeper of the Records thereof I do

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this

Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled apsaid office.

Date:	April 21, 2020
	Mauro Illorios
	Clerk of the Property Tay Appeal Roard

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Kimberly Dsida, by attorney: Robert Rosenfeld Robert H. Rosenfeld and Associates, LLC 33 North Dearborn Street Suite 1850 Chicago, IL 60602

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review County Building, Room 601 118 North Clark Street Chicago, IL 60602