



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION  
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Nicole Fernandez  
DOCKET NO.: 17-22878.001-R-1  
PARCEL NO.: 05-20-313-020-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Nicole Fernandez, the appellant, by attorney Robert Rosenfeld of Robert H. Rosenfeld and Associates, LLC in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds **No Change** in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$33,075  
**IMPR.:** \$154,222  
**TOTAL:** \$187,297

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

**Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2017 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

**Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a two-story dwelling of masonry exterior construction with 5,318 square feet of living area. The dwelling is approximately 4 years old. Features of the home include a basement with a finished recreational area, central air conditioning, three fireplaces and a three-car garage. The property has a 22,811 square foot site and is located in Winnetka, New Trier Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-09 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant through counsel contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. The subject's land assessment was not contested. In support of this argument the appellant submitted information on three equity comparables located in the same neighborhood code as the subject. The comparables were improved with similar Class 2-09 dwellings of masonry exterior construction that range in age from 11 to 86 years old. Each comparable has a basement with two comparables having finished area, central air conditioning, two or three fireplaces and a 3.5-car or 4-car garage. The dwellings range in size from 5,195 to 7,721 square feet of living area

and have improvement assessments ranging from \$112,835 to \$156,147 or from \$20.22 to \$21.72 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested that the improvement assessment be reduced to \$112,423 or \$21.14 per square foot of living area.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$187,297. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$154,222 or \$29.00 per square foot of living area.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on three equity comparables located in the same neighborhood code and within the same block as the subject. The comparables were improved two-story dwellings of masonry exterior construction that range in size from 5,450 to 6,565 square feet of living area and range in age from 9 to 13 years old. Each comparable has a basement with finished area, central air conditioning, four fireplaces and a three-car garage. The comparables have improvement assessments that ranged from \$163,119 to \$176,795 or from \$26.33 to \$29.93 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested that the assessment be confirmed.

### **Conclusion of Law**

The taxpayer contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The parties submitted six comparables for the Boards consideration. The Board gave less weight to the appellants comparables #1 and #3 based on their dwellings being considerably older in age when compared to the subject. The Board gave less weight to the appellants comparable #2 based on its unfinished basement when compared to the subject.

The Board finds that the best evidence of assessment equity are the board of reviews comparables. These comparables have varying degrees of similarity when compared to the subject in design, age, dwelling size and features. These comparables have improvement assessments that range from \$163,119 to \$176,795 or from \$26.33 to \$29.93 per square foot of living area. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$154,222 or \$29.00 per square foot of living area, which falls below the range an improvement assessment basis and within range on a per square foot basis. Based on this record the Board finds the appellant did not demonstrate with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement assessment was inequitable assessed and a reduction in the subjects assessment is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.



Chairman



Member



Member



Member



Member

DISSENTING: \_\_\_\_\_

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:

May 18, 2021



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

**IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois  
Property Tax Appeal Board  
William G. Stratton Building, Room 402  
401 South Spring Street  
Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Nicole Fernandez, by attorney:  
Robert Rosenfeld  
Robert H. Rosenfeld and Associates, LLC  
33 North Dearborn Street  
Suite 1850  
Chicago, IL 60602

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review  
County Building, Room 601  
118 North Clark Street  
Chicago, IL 60602