

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: IH3 Property Illinois, LP

DOCKET NO.: 16-38806.001-R-1 PARCEL NO.: 10-14-206-012-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are IH3 Property Illinois, LP, the appellant, by attorney Robert Rosenfeld, of Robert H. Rosenfeld and Associates, LLC in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds <u>A Reduction</u> in the assessment of the property as established by the Cook County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$4,950 **IMPR.:** \$28,733 **TOTAL:** \$33,683

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

# **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

#### **Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a two-story dwelling of frame and masonry exterior construction with 1,475 square feet of living area. The dwelling is 77 years old. Features of the home include a slab foundation, a fireplace, and a one-car garage. The property has a 5,500 square foot site and is located in Evanston, Niles Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-05 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.<sup>1</sup>

The appellant contends assessment inequity with respect to the improvement as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted information on three equity comparables that are located within the same neighborhood code as the subject property. The comparables are class 2-05 dwellings of frame and masonry exterior construction containing

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The Board finds the only evidence of the subject's property description was provided within the appellant's evidence.

from 1,643 to 1,943 square feet of living area. The dwellings range in age from 68 to 77 years old and, unlike the subject, have full basements with two having finished areas. Two comparables feature central air conditioning, and each comparable has one or two fireplaces and a one-car attached garage. The comparables have improvement assessments ranging from \$32,264 to \$39,100 or from \$18.44 to \$20.12 per square foot of living area.

Based on this evidence the appellant's requested the subject's improvement assessment be reduced to \$28,733.

The appellant's submission revealed that the subject has an improvement assessment of \$33,243 which equates to \$22.54 per square foot of living area.

The board of review did not timely submit any evidence in support of the assessment of the subject property or to refute the appellant's argument as required by section 1910.40(a) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board and is found to be in default pursuant to section 1910.69(a) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board. (86 Ill.Admin.Code 1910.40(a) & 1910.69(a)).

# **Conclusion of Law**

The taxpayer contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b). The Board finds the appellant met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The Board finds the only evidence of assessment equity to be the appellant's comparables. These comparables have improvement assessments ranging from \$18.44 to \$20.12 per square foot of living area. The subject's improvement assessment of \$22.54 per square foot of living area falls above the range established by the only comparables in this record. After considering adjustments to the comparables for differences when compared to the subject, such as the subject's inferior slab foundation, the Board finds the subject's improvement assessment is not supported. The Board further finds the board of review did not timely submit any evidence in support of its assessment of the subject property or to refute the evidence submitted by the appellant as required by Section1910.40(a) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board and is in default pursuant to Section 1910.69(a) of the rules of the Board. (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.40(a); 1910.69(a)). Based on this record, the Board finds the appellant demonstrated with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement was inequitably assessed and a reduction in the subject's assessment commensurate with the appellant's request is justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

21.	te	
Chair	rman	
	Robert Stoffen	
Member	Member	
Dan De Kinie	Sarah Bokley	
Member	Member	
DISSENTING:		
<u>CERTIFICATION</u>		
As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof. I do		

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:	April 21, 2020	
	$M_{\bullet}$ $O(a)$	
	Mano Illorios	
	Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board	

#### **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

# PARTIES OF RECORD

## **AGENCY**

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

## **APPELLANT**

IH3 Property Illinois, LP, by attorney: Robert Rosenfeld Robert H. Rosenfeld and Associates, LLC 33 North Dearborn Street Suite 1850 Chicago, IL 60602

## **COUNTY**

Cook County Board of Review County Building, Room 601 118 North Clark Street Chicago, IL 60602