



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Fazal Puthawala
DOCKET NO.: 16-38675.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 10-18-103-035-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Fazal Puthawala, the appellant(s); and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds **No Change** in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$ 6,796
IMPR.: \$ 57,668
TOTAL: \$ 64,464

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board (the "Board") finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject consists of a two-story dwelling of masonry construction with 3,721 square feet of living area. The dwelling is nine years old. Features of the home include a full unfinished basement, central air conditioning, two fireplaces, and a two-car garage. The property has a 9,375 square foot site, and is located in Morton Grove, Niles Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-78 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance. No evidence was submitted as to whether the subject was owner occupied.

The appellant contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted information on three equity comparables.

The appellant also contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant's submission stated that the subject property was purchased on January 2, 2017 for a price of \$473,000. No evidence was submitted in support of this assertion.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$64,464. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$57,668, or \$15.50 per square foot of living area. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$644,640, or \$173.24 per square foot of living area, including land, when applying the 2016 statutory level of assessment for class 2 property of 10.00% under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on four equity comparables, and four sale comparables.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The Board finds that there is no evidence in the record that shows the sale price of the subject. As clearly stated in Section IV – Recent Sale Data of the Board's residential appeal form, "[the appellant] must submit evidence of the actual sales price by including a sales contract, RESPA statement, Real Estate Transfer Declaration (Department of Revenue), and/or settlement statement." The appellant did not submit any such documentation. While the appellant's pleadings state that the sale price was \$473,000, no evidence shows this as being the sale price. The Board's decision is to be based on equity and the *weight of the evidence*. 35 ILCS 200/16-185 (emphasis added). As stated above, there is no evidence to give any weight to regarding the sale price. Therefore, on this record, the Board finds that the appellant has not proven, by a preponderance of the evidence, that the subject is overvalued.

The taxpayer contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b).

The Board finds the best evidence of assessment equity to be appellant comparables #1, #2, and #3, and board of review comparables #3 and #4. These comparables had improvement assessments that ranged from \$13.75 to \$19.97 per square foot of living area. The subject's assessment of \$15.50 per square foot of living area falls within the range established by the best comparables in this record. Based on this record, the Board finds the appellant did not

demonstrate with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement was inequitably assessed, and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified based on the appellant's equity argument.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.



Chairman



Member



Member

Member



Member

DISSENTING: _____

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: January 15, 2019



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois
Property Tax Appeal Board
William G. Stratton Building, Room 402
401 South Spring Street
Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Fazal Puthawala
7348 Crain Street
Niles, IL 60714

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review
County Building, Room 601
118 North Clark Street
Chicago, IL 60602