



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: William A. Carpenter
DOCKET NO.: 16-28490.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 18-18-400-040-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are William A. Carpenter, the appellant, by attorney Craig J. Donnewald of Finkel Martwick & Colson, PC, in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds **A Reduction** in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$ 8,112
IMPR.: \$84,388
TOTAL: \$92,500

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a two-story dwelling of brick and frame exterior construction that is 2 years old. The dwelling contains 4,460 square feet of living area and is situated on an 8,112-square foot site. Features include central air conditioning, a fireplace, and a three-car garage. The subject is a Class 2-08 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance. The subject property is located in Lyons Township, Cook County.

The appellant contends both overvaluation and assessment inequity as the bases of the appeal. The subject's land assessment was not challenged. In support of the inequity argument, the appellant submitted four assessment comparables with varying degrees of similarity when compared to the subject. The comparables have improvement assessments ranging from \$84,674 to \$93,996 or from \$18.39 to \$21.00 per square foot of living area.

In support of the overvaluation argument, the appellant partially completed Section IV of the Residential Appeal petition indicating the subject property was purchased in August 2015 for \$870,493 from a developer. The appellant submitted a copy of the settlement statement associated with the sale of the subject property.

The appellant also submitted the final decision issued by the board of review disclosing the subject's assessment of \$110,424. The subject's assessment reflects an estimated market value of \$1,104,240 when applying the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance level of assessment for Class 2 property of 10%. The appellant reported the subject property has an improvement assessment of \$102,312 or \$22.94 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a "blended" assessment of \$92,500 that takes into consideration both the market value and inequity claims.

The board of review did not timely submit its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" or any evidence in support of its assessment of the subject property as required by section 1910.40(a) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.40(a). Therefore, the board of review was found to be in default pursuant to section 1910.69(a) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.69(a).

Conclusion of Law

The taxpayer argued assessment inequity as the basis to the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Additionally, the appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). The Board finds the appellant met these burdens of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The Board finds the only evidence of uniformity of assessments are the four assessment comparables submitted by the appellant. These comparables had varying degrees of similarity when compared to the subject. They have improvement assessments ranging from \$84,674 to \$93,996 or from \$18.39 to \$21.00 per square foot of living area. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$102,312 or \$22.94 per square foot of living area, which falls above the range established by the only assessment comparables contained in the record and supports a reduction in the subject's assessment. In addition, the record shows the subject property was purchased in August 2015 for \$870,493. The subject's assessment reflects an estimated market value of \$1,104,240, considerably more than its sale price, which further demonstrates the subject's assessment is excessive. The board of review did not timely submit any evidence in support of the correct assessment of the subject property or to refute the value evidence submitted by the appellant. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.40(a). Therefore, the board of review was found to be in default pursuant to section 1910.69(a) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.69(a). Based on this analysis, the Board finds a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted commensurate with the appellant's request.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

Chairman



Member

Member



Member

Member

DISSENTING: _____

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: September 17, 2019



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois
Property Tax Appeal Board
William G. Stratton Building, Room 402
401 South Spring Street
Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

William A. Carpenter, by attorney:
Craig J. Donnewald
Finkel Martwick & Colson, PC
203 North LaSalle Street
Suite 1350
Chicago, IL 60601-1293

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review
County Building, Room 601
118 North Clark Street
Chicago, IL 60602