

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Robert Bernstein
DOCKET NO.: 16-23454.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 14-29-402-004-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Robert Bernstein, the appellant, by attorney Noah J. Schmidt, of Schmidt Salzman & Moran, Ltd. in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$19,200 IMPR.: \$56,588 TOTAL: \$75,788

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a three-story, multi-family dwelling of masonry construction. The dwelling is approximately 127 years old and has 3,411 square feet of living area. Features of the dwelling include three apartment units and a full unfinished basement. The property has a 3,000 square-foot site and is located in Chicago, Lake View Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-11 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted information on five equity comparables with the same neighborhood and classification codes as the subject. The comparables are improved with one, three-story and four, two-story, multi-family dwellings of frame, frame and masonry or masonry construction. The dwellings are from 117 to 132 years old and contain from 3,276 to 3,558

square feet of living area. The comparables have two or three apartment units. Four comparables have full or partial unfinished basements. One comparable has a partial basement finished for an apartment. One comparable has three fireplaces, and three comparables have two-car garages. The comparables have improvement assessments that range from \$43,636 to \$53,014 or from \$13.32 to \$15.45 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's improvement assessment to \$50,823 or \$14.90 per square foot of living area.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" wherein the subject's final assessment of \$75,788 was disclosed. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$56,588 or \$16.59 per square foot of living area. The board of review presented descriptions and assessment information on three comparable properties that have the same neighborhood and classification codes as the subject. The comparables were described as being located on the same block as the subject. The comparables are improved with three-story, multi-family dwellings of masonry construction. The dwellings are 127 years old and contain from 2,769 to 3,675 square feet of living area. The board of review did not report the number of apartment units; however, each comparable has three full bathrooms. The comparables have full unfinished basements. The comparable properties have improvement assessments that range from \$48,181 to \$62,264 or from \$16.87 to \$17.40 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

Conclusion of Law

The taxpayer contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The Board finds the parties presented assessment data on a total of eight suggested comparables. The appellant's comparables #2 through #5 received reduced weight in the Board's analysis due to their two-story design that differed from the subject's three-story design. In addition, board of review comparable #3 has significantly less living area than the subject and also received reduced weight. The Board finds the best evidence of assessment equity to be the appellant's comparable #1 and board of review comparables #1 and #2. The Board finds these three comparables are three-story, multi-family dwellings of masonry construction like the subject and are also very similar in location, age, living area and foundation. These comparables have improvement assessments that range from \$43,636 to \$62,264 or from \$13.32 to \$16.94 per square foot of living area. The subject's improvement assessment of \$56,588 or \$16.59 per square foot of living area falls within the range established by the best comparables in this record. After considering adjustments to the comparables for differences from the subject, the Board finds the appellant did not demonstrate with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement was inequitably assessed and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

said office.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

	Chairman
21. Fer	a R
Member	Member
Sobet Stoffen	Dan Dikini
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	
<u>CERTIFICATION</u>	
As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the	

Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this

Date: July 16, 2019

Maus Illorias

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Robert Bernstein, by attorney: Noah J. Schmidt Schmidt Salzman & Moran, Ltd. 111 West Washington Street Suite 1300 Chicago, IL 60602

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review County Building, Room 601 118 North Clark Street Chicago, IL 60602