

### FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT:	Elizabeth Johnstone
DOCKET NO.:	16-22920.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.:	14-17-107-023-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Elizabeth Johnstone, the appellant, by attorney John S. Xydakis, of the Law Offices of John S. Xydakis in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds <u>No Change</u> in the assessment of the property as established by the Cook County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND:	\$21,004
IMPR.:	\$36,063
TOTAL:	\$57,067

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

#### **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

#### **Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a two-story dwelling of stucco construction. The dwelling is 117 years old and has 2,153 square feet of living area. Features of the home include a full unfinished basement, central air conditioning and a two-car garage. The property has a 5,001 square-foot site and is located in Chicago, Lake View Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-05 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. The subject's land assessment is not being contested in this appeal. In support of the inequity argument, the appellant submitted information on four equity comparables with the same neighborhood and classification codes as the subject. The comparables are improved with two-story dwellings of frame or stucco construction. The dwellings are from 112 to 127 years old and contain from

1,720 to 2,180 square feet of living area. Each comparable has a basement. Information regarding garages was not provided on the appellant's grid analysis. The appellant also submitted a map which revealed that three of the comparables were located near the subject property. The comparables have improvement assessments ranging from \$22,314 to \$28,507 or from \$11.88 to \$13.08 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's improvement assessment to \$27,903 or \$12.96 per square foot of living area.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" wherein the subject's final assessment of \$57,067 was disclosed. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$36,063 or \$16.75 per square foot of living area. The board of review presented descriptions and assessment information on four comparable properties with the same neighborhood and classification codes as the subject. One comparable was described as being located on the same block as the subject property. The comparables are improved with two-story dwellings of frame or stucco construction. The dwellings are from 109 to 117 years old and contain from 1,906 to 2,066 square feet of living area. Each comparable has a full basement, two with finished area; two comparables have central air conditioning; three have fireplaces; and each has a garage, either one-car or two-car. The board of review's comparable properties have improvement assessments ranging from \$32,337 to \$51,428 or from \$16.97 to \$26.69 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

### **Conclusion of Law**

The taxpayer contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The parties presented assessment data on a total of eight suggested comparables. The Board finds the appellant's comparable #3 had less living area than the subject and was not located as close to the subject as the other comparables submitted for this appeal. As a result, appellant's comparable #3 received reduced weight in the Board's analysis. The Board finds the seven remaining comparables were similar to the subject in location, two-story design, age, living area and foundation. In addition, four of these seven comparables had stucco exterior construction like the subject. The Board finds the appellant's comparables #1, #2 and #4 and the comparables submitted by the board of review had improvement assessments that ranged from \$23,668 to \$51,428 or from \$11.88 to \$26.69 per square foot of living area. The subject's improvement assessment of \$36,063 or \$16.75 per square foot of living area falls within the range established by the best comparables in this record. After considering adjustments to the comparables for differences from the subject, the Board finds the appellant did not demonstrate with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement was inequitably assessed and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

	Chairman
22. Fer	ChR-
Member	Member
Aster Staffer	Dan Dikini
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	

# <u>CERTIFICATION</u>

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:

May 21, 2019

Mano Morios

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

### **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND</u> <u>EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

## PARTIES OF RECORD

### AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

### APPELLANT

Elizabeth Johnstone, by attorney: John S. Xydakis Law Offices of John S. Xydakis 30 North Michigan Avenue Suite 402 Chicago, IL 60602

### COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review County Building, Room 601 118 North Clark Street Chicago, IL 60602