

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT:	Jolee Rosenkranz
DOCKET NO.:	16-21426.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.:	10-12-106-009-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Jolee Rosenkranz, the appellant(s), by attorney William J. Davy, of the Law Offices of William J. Davy in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds <u>No Change</u> in the assessment of the property as established by the Cook County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND:	\$10,187
IMPR.:	\$62,941
TOTAL:	\$73,128

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property is a 108 year-old, two-story dwelling of stucco construction containing 3,040 square feet of living area. The property has an 8,150 square foot site located in Evanston, Evanston Township, Cook County. The evidence did not disclose whether the subject was owner-occupied in the lien year. The subject is a Class 2 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant contends assessment inequity and overvaluation as the bases of the appeal. In support of the assessment inequity argument, the appellant submitted information on three suggested equity comparable properties. In support of the overvaluation argument, the appellant submitted a brief entitled, "Recent Purchase Analysis." A grid appended to the brief disclosed

the conveyance of the subject to the appellant via a Warranty Deed for a transaction dated August 10, 2012 for \$590,000. In his brief, the appellant disclosed the purchase price had been adjusted by an estimated 2.50% for personal property not subject to real estate taxation. The subject's sale price reflects a market value of \$194.08 per square foot of living area including land. The appellant provided incomplete information in Section IV–Recent Sale Data of the Residential Appeal that the subject was not transferred between related parties and was advertised and sold by a realtor. The appellant did not submit additional information or documentary evidence. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to \$57,525.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$73,128. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$62,941, or \$20.70 per square foot of living area. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$731,280, or \$240.55 per square foot of living area, when applying the 2016 level of assessment of 10.00% for Class 2 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance. In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on three suggested equity comparable properties, one of which included sale information.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The Board finds the best evidence of assessment equity to be the appellant's comparable(s) #1 and #2, and the board of review's comparable(s) #1 and #3. These comparable properties were most similar with the subject and had improvement assessments that ranged from \$19.07 to \$21.70 per square foot of living area. The subject's improvement assessment of \$20.70 per square foot of living area falls within the range established by the best comparable properties in this record. Based on this record, the Board finds the appellant did not demonstrate with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement was inequitably assessed and holds that a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

The appellant also contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The Board gives no weight to the subject's 2012 sale since it is not a recent sale. Therefore, the Board finds a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

Mano Moios Chairman Member Member Member Member **DISSENTING:**

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:

March 19, 2019

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND</u> <u>EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Jolee Rosenkranz, by attorney: William J. Davy Law Offices of William J. Davy 200 South Wacker Drive Suite 3100 Chicago, IL 60606

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review County Building, Room 601 118 North Clark Street Chicago, IL 60602