

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Gill Midyan

DOCKET NO.: 16-21315.001-R-1 PARCEL NO.: 11-19-216-020-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Gill Midyan, the appellant, by attorney Robert Rosenfeld, of Robert H. Rosenfeld and Associates, LLC in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$24,309 **IMPR.:** \$122,447 **TOTAL:** \$146,756

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

## **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

#### **Findings of Fact**

The subject property is improved with a 3-story<sup>1</sup> masonry dwelling containing 6,650 square feet of living area. The dwelling is 102 years old and features a full unfinished basement, central air conditioning, 3 fireplaces and a 2-car garage. The subject is located in Evanston, Evanston Township, Cook County. It is classified as a Class 2-09 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted information on three, 2-story, Class 2-09 comparables. The appellant did not report the proximity of the comparables to the subject but disclosed they have the same neighborhood code as the subject. One comparable is on the same street as the subject.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The board of review describes the subject as a 3-story dwelling. The photographic evidence submitted by both parties indicates the subject is a 2½-story dwelling.

The comparables are 108 or 115 years old and range in size from 5,808 to 6,721 square feet of living area. The comparables feature unfinished basements and 1 or 2 fireplaces. One comparable features central air conditioning and two have 2-car garages. The comparables have improvement assessments ranging from \$104,827 to \$121,307 or \$16.12 and \$18.05 per square foot of living area. The appellant's attorney submitted a brief requesting the subject's total assessment be reduced to \$140,086. Based on this evidence the appellant requested the subject's improvement assessment be reduced to \$115,777 or \$17.41 per square foot of living area.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$146,756. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$122,447 or \$18.41 per square foot of living area.

In support of the assessment the board of review submitted information on three, 2-story, Class 2-09 comparables having the same neighborhood code as the subject and located within a quarter-mile of the subject. The comparables range in age from 100 to 106 years old and range in size from 5,985 to 6,119 square feet of living area. They feature full unfinished basements, 2 to 6 fireplaces, and 2 or  $2\frac{1}{2}$ -car garages. Two comparables have central air conditioning. The comparables have improvement assessments ranging from \$110,663 to \$183,121 or from \$18.49 to \$30.13 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

## **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The parties submitted a total of six comparables for the Board's consideration. The Board gives less weight to appellant's comparables #2 and #3 and to board of review comparable #3 due to their lack of central air conditioning as compared to the subject. The Board gives more weight to appellant's comparable #1 and to board of review comparables #1 and #2 which have varying degrees of similarity to the subject in location, age, style, dwelling size and features. These comparables have improvement assessments ranging from \$105,664 to \$183,121 or from \$16.12 to \$30.13 per square foot of living area. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$122,447 or \$18.41 per square foot of living area which is within the range established by the most similar comparables in the record. After considering adjustments to the comparables for differences to the subject, the Board finds the appellant did not demonstrate with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement was inequitably assessed and a reduction in the subject's improvement assessment based on inequity is not warranted.

said office.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

Chairman	
21. Fe	a R
Member	Member
assert Stoffen	Dan De Kinin
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	
<u>CERTIFICATION</u>	
As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and compl Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above the complete of the comple	ete Final Administrative Decision of the

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

Mauro Illorias

May 21, 2019

### **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Date:

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

## PARTIES OF RECORD

## **AGENCY**

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

## **APPELLANT**

Gill Midyan, by attorney: Robert Rosenfeld Robert H. Rosenfeld and Associates, LLC 33 North Dearborn Street Suite 1850 Chicago, IL 60602

## **COUNTY**

Cook County Board of Review County Building, Room 601 118 North Clark Street Chicago, IL 60602