

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

OAPPELLANT:	Vincent J. Incopero
DOCKET NO.:	16-20810.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.:	16-20-204-006-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Vincent J. Incopero, the appellant; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds <u>No Change</u> in the assessment of the property as established by the Cook County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND:	\$ 6,250
IMPR.:	\$37,464
TOTAL:	\$43,714

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a one- and part two-story mixed use building of masonry construction with 2,572 square feet of building area. The property has a 3,125 square foot site and is located in Cicero Township, Cook County. The property is a class 5 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted an appraisal, prepared by Joseph Ryan, estimating the subject property had a market value of \$45,000, or \$17.50 per square foot of building area, as of January 1, 2016. The appraisal states that the subject is in fair condition, but vacant. The appraiser used four sales comparables in reaching the conclusion of value. Those comparables range: in size from 1,902 to 5,479 square feet of building area; in sale date from July, 2012 to April, 2014; and in sale price from \$4.56 to \$26.29 per square foot of building area.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$43,714. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$174,856 or \$67.98 per square foot of building area, including land, when applying the 2016 statutory level of assessments for class 5 property of 25% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on 11 sales comparables. Those comparables range: in size from 1,537 to 3,200 square feet of building area; in sale date from July, 2014 to December, 2016; and in sale price from \$82.69 to \$613.39 square feet of building area.

At hearing, the appellant argued the water and other utilities were shut off in 2016. In support of this proposition, the appellant submitted a print out from the Town of Cicero, marked as Appellant's Hearing Exhibit #1. In addition, the appellant submitted a copy of a sign, marked as Appellant's Hearing Exhibit #2, which he stated was placed on the subject for building code violations. The appellant did not submit the building code violation citation itself or any other evidence of the actual violations. The appellant also argued that the subject was vandalized, and the furnace was stolen. In support of this proposition, the appellant submitted pictures of the subject property as of 2016, marked as Appellant's Group Hearing Exhibit #3. The board of review rested on the evidence.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The Board finds that throughout the hearing the appellant's testimony was evasive and defensive. Appellant's statements are contradictory to the subject's description as provided by the appellant's own appraisal.

The Board gives no weight to the adjustments and conclusions of value in the appellant's appraisal because the appraiser was not present or called to testify about his qualifications, identify his work, testify about the content of the evidence, or be cross-examined by the board of review and the Property Tax Appeal Board. Without the ability to observe the demeanor of this individual during the course of testimony, the Property Tax Appeal Board gives this evidence from the appellant diminished weight.

The Board will consider the raw sales data submitted by the appellant within the appraisal. The courts have stated that where there is credible evidence of comparable sales, these sales are to be given significant weight as evidence of market value. Chrysler Corp. v. Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board, 69 Ill.App.3d 207 (2nd Dist. 1979); Willow Hill Grain, Inc. v. Property Tax Appeal Board, 187 Ill.App.3d 9 (5th Dist. 1989). Therefore, the Board will consider the raw sales data.

The Board finds that the appellant submitted four comparable sales and the board of review submitted 11 comparable sales. The Board finds the appellant's sales comparables #1, #2, and #4, and the board of review's comparable sales #1, #4, and #7 to be similar and most probative in determining the subject's market value. These properties sold for prices ranging from \$12.93 to \$88.89 per square foot of building area. In comparison, the subject assessment value reflects a market value of \$17.50 per square foot of building area, which is within the range. After adjustments to comparables, the Board finds that the subject's improvement was not overvalued and a reduction in the subject's market value is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

	Chairman
22. Fer	ChR-
Member	Member
Aster Soffer	Dan Dikini
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:

May 21, 2019

Mano Morios

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND</u> <u>EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Vincent J. Incopero PO Box 146 Elmhurst, IL 60126

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review County Building, Room 601 118 North Clark Street Chicago, IL 60602