

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Hamdy Elhadary
DOCKET NO.: 16-20570.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 05-31-101-148-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Hamdy Elhadary, the appellant, by attorney Robert Rosenfeld, of Robert H. Rosenfeld and Associates, LLC in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$9,737 **IMPR.:** \$66,453 **TOTAL:** \$76,190

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

# **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

# **Findings of Fact**

The subject property is improved with a four-year old, two-story, single-family dwelling of frame construction with 3,280 square feet of living area. Features of the home include: a full basement, central air conditioning, one fireplace and a two-car garage. The subject' is sited on 10,250 square feet of land and is located in New Trier Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2, residential property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted information on four equity comparables. They are improved with a two-story, frame or frame and masonry, single-family dwelling. The improvements range: in age from 12 to 25 years; in size from 3,364 to 3,760 square feet of living area; and in

improvement assessments from \$16.80 to \$20.26 per square foot. Amenities include: a partial or full basement, central air conditioning, from one to two fireplaces, and from a two-car to a three-car garage.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$76,190. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$66,453 or \$20.26 per square foot of living area. In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on four equity comparables. They are improved with a two-story, masonry, single-family dwelling located either within a two-block radius of the subject or within the subject's subarea. The improvements range: in age from 7 to 12 years; in size from 3,031 to 3,204 square feet of living area; and in improvement assessments from \$21.87 to \$34.47 per square foot. Amenities include: a full basement, central air conditioning, from one to three fireplaces, and from a two-car to a three-car garage.

# **Conclusion of Law**

The taxpayer contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b). The Board finds the appellant *did not meet* this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment *is not* warranted.

The Board finds the best evidence of assessment equity to be appellant's comparable #4 as well as the board of review's comparables #1, #2 and #3. These four comparables had improvement assessments that ranged from \$20.10 to \$34.47 per square foot of living area. The subject's improvement assessment of \$20.26 per square foot of living area falls at the low end of the range established by the best comparables in this record. Based on this record, the Board finds the appellant did not demonstrate with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement was inequitably assessed and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

said office.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

21. Fem	
Cl	nairman
C. R.	Sobet Stoffen
Member	Member
Dan De Kinin	Sarah Bokley
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	
<u>CERTIFICATION</u>	
As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the	

hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this

> April 21, 2020 Date: Mano Illorios Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

#### **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

# PARTIES OF RECORD

# **AGENCY**

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

# **APPELLANT**

Hamdy Elhadary, by attorney: Robert Rosenfeld Robert H. Rosenfeld and Associates, LLC 33 North Dearborn Street Suite 1850 Chicago, IL 60602

# **COUNTY**

Cook County Board of Review County Building, Room 601 118 North Clark Street Chicago, IL 60602