

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT:	American Homes 4Rent Prop
DOCKET NO.:	16-05975.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.:	05-03-110-016

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are American Homes 4Rent Prop, the appellant, by attorney Michael R. Davies, of Ryan Law LLP in Chicago; and the DuPage County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds <u>No Change</u> in the assessment of the property as established by the **DuPage** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND:	\$5,500
IMPR.:	\$45,890
TOTAL:	\$51,390

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the DuPage County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a two-story condominium of frame construction with 1,392 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 1995. Features of the home include central air conditioning, 2.5 baths and a 264 square foot garage. The property is located in Carol Stream, Milton Township, DuPage County.

The appellant submitted evidence before the Property Tax Appeal Board claiming overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of the overvaluation claim, the appellant submitted limited descriptive information for three comparable properties that were reported to be located from 1.45 to 1.67 miles from the subject property. The Board requested that the appellant complete the grid analysis in Section V of the appeal petition. The appellant failed to comply with the Board's request and failed to disclose the comparables' exterior construction, foundation type and features such as central air conditioning, fireplaces and garages. The comparables were reported to consist of two-story dwellings that were built from 1963 to 1975 and range in size from 1,020 to 1,224 square feet of above grade living area. The comparables have sites reported to range in size from 1,478 to 7,662 square feet of land area. The comparables sold from July to September 2016 for prices ranging from \$59,100 to \$151,667 or from \$48.28 to \$137.38 per square foot of living area, land included. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$51,390. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$154,371 or \$110.90 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2016 three-year average median level of assessment for DuPage County of 33.29% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted a grid analysis along with property record cards on four comparable sales located in the same neighborhood code as the subject as defined by the township assessor. The comparables are described as two-story condominiums containing 1,392 square feet of living area. The comparables were built in 1995 or 1996. Each comparable has central air conditioning, 2.5 baths and a garage with 264 square feet of building area. The comparables sold from March 2015 to March 2016 for prices ranging from \$164,000 to \$189,900 or from \$117.82 to \$136.42 per square foot of living area, including land.

The board of review also noted that the appellant's comparables were located in a different township than the subject property. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The Board finds the parties submitted nine comparable sales for consideration. The Board gave less weight to the appellant's comparables as the appellant's attorney failed to provide descriptive information for a comparative analysis which detracts from the weight of the evidence. Furthermore, the comparables appear to be dissimilar single-family homes considerably older in age and located in a different township over 1.45 miles from the subject.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the comparables submitted by the board of review. These six comparables are nearly identical to the subject in location, design, age, dwelling size, and features. The comparables sold from March 2015 to March 2016 for prices ranging from \$164,000 to \$189,900 or from \$117.82 to \$136.42 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$154,371 or \$110.90 per square foot of living area, including land which falls below the range as established by the most

similar comparable sales in this record. Based on this record, the Board finds the appellant failed to demonstrate by a preponderance of the evidence that the subject was overvalued and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

	Chairman
22. Fer	ChR-
Member	Member
Aster Staffer	Dan Dikini
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	

<u>CERTIFICATION</u>

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:

June 18, 2019

Mano Morios

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND</u> <u>EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

American Homes 4Rent Prop, by attorney: Michael R. Davies Ryan Law LLP 311 South Wacker Drive Mailbox #29 Chicago, IL 60606

COUNTY

DuPage County Board of Review DuPage Center 421 N. County Farm Road Wheaton, IL 60187