

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT:	AMER HOMES 4 & RENT PROP FOUR
DOCKET NO.:	16-05516.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.:	11-25-401-018

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are AMER HOMES 4 & RENT PROP FOUR, the appellant, by attorney Michael R. Davies of Ryan Law LLP in Chicago; and the McHenry County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *no change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **McHenry** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND:	\$9,194
IMPR.:	\$33,944
TOTAL:	\$43,138

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

## **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the McHenry County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

## **Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a split-level dwelling of frame and brick exterior construction with 1,486 square feet of above grade living area. The dwelling was constructed in 1999. Features of the home include a partial basement with finished area, central air conditioning and a two-car garage.<sup>1</sup> The property has a 12,033 square foot site and is located in Marengo, Marengo Township, McHenry County.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted a list of nine comparable sales that sold from January 2013 to May 2015 for prices ranging from \$98,000 to \$127,900. The appellant provided no substantive descriptive

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Appellant's counsel provided limited information regarding the features of the subject property beyond its age and above-grade living area. Descriptive details concerning the subject were provided by the board of review with a property record card and are reflected in this decision.

information about the comparables other than that four dwellings were built from 1985 to 1999 and two comparables contain either 1,644 or 1,730 square feet of above grade living area. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$43,138. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$129,582 or \$87.20 per square foot of above grade living area, land included, when using the 2016 three-year average median level of assessment for McHenry County of 33.29% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In response to the appeal, the board of review noted that based upon the comparable sales gathered by the township assessor, the subject is under-assessed. In further support of this claim, the board of review provided a Multiple Listing Service sheet depicting the subject property was listed for sale on May 8, 2018 for a price of \$179,000 and had a contract date of May 23, 2018.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on four comparable sales located within .2 of a mile of the subject property. The comparables consist of one, one-story dwelling and three, split-level dwellings of frame exterior construction ranging in size from 1,008 to 1,541 square feet of above grade living area. The dwellings were built from 1994 to 2003. The three split-level dwellings each have a partial basement with finished area. Each comparable features central air conditioning and a garage containing 480 or 560 square feet of building area. The comparables sold from March 2015 to July 2016 for prices ranging from \$123,000 to \$162,000 or from \$100.94 to \$122.02 per square foot of above grade living area, including land.

While the board of review noted the subject appeared to be under-valued, the board of review did not request a change in the subject's assessment.

## **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The parties provided a total of 13 comparable sales to support their respective positions before the Property Tax Appeal Board. The Board finds that little weight shall be given to the appellant's evidence as it contained no substantive descriptive information about the dwellings to allow the Property Tax Appeal Board to conduct a meaningful comparative analysis of the comparable sales as compared to the subject property. Additionally, six of the appellant's comparables sold in 2013 and 2014, not as proximate in time to the assessment date as the sales provided by the board of review. The Board has also given reduced weight to board of review comparable #1 due to its dissimilar one-story design when compared to the subject's split-level design. The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be comparable sales #2, #3 and #4 submitted by the board of review. These three comparables are most similar to the subject in location, dwelling size, design, age and features. The comparables sold from March 2015 to July 2016 for prices ranging from \$150,000 to \$162,000 or from \$100.94 to \$105.13 per square foot of above grade living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$129,582 or \$87.20 per square foot of above grade living area, including land, which is below the range established by the best comparable sales in this record both in terms of overall value and on a per-square-foot basis. As noted by the McHenry County Board of Review, based on the best market value evidence in the record and further supported by the subject's recent listing price of \$179,000, the subject property appears to be under-assessed.

On this record, the Board finds no reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

	Chairman
22. Fer	C R
Member	Member
hover Stoffer	Dan Dikinin
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	

## CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:

February 18, 2020

Mano Allorino

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

## **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND</u> <u>EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

# PARTIES OF RECORD

## AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

AMER HOMES 4 & RENT PROP FOUR, by attorney: Michael R. Davies Ryan Law LLP 311 South Wacker Drive Mailbox #29 Chicago, IL 60606

COUNTY

McHenry County Board of Review McHenry County Government Center 2200 N. Seminary Ave. Woodstock, IL 60098