

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: AMH 2014 2 & Borrower LLC

DOCKET NO.: 16-05498.001-R-1 PARCEL NO.: 09-18-256-014

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are AMH 2014 2 & Borrower LLC, the appellant, by attorney Michael R. Davies, of Ryan Law LLP in Chicago; and the McHenry County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **McHenry** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$9,711 **IMPR.:** \$34,966 **TOTAL:** \$44,677

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

## **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the McHenry County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

#### **Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a tri-level dwelling of frame exterior construction with 1,240 square feet of above grade living area. The dwelling was constructed in 1996. Features of the home include a basement, a partially finished lower level, central air conditioning, one fireplace and a two-car garage.<sup>1</sup> The property has a 15,167 square foot site and is located in Wonder Lake, McHenry Township, McHenry County.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted a list of eleven comparable sales that sold from January 2013 to December 2015 for prices ranging from \$41,000 to \$125,000. The appellant provided no substantive

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Appellant's counsel provided limited information regarding the features of the subject property beyond its age and above-grade living area. Descriptive details concerning the subject were provided by the board of review with a property record card and are reflected in this decision

descriptive information about the comparables other than the dwellings were built from 1935 to 1998 and range in size from 780 to 1,405 square feet of above grade living area. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$44,677. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$134,205 or \$108.23 per square foot of above grade living area, land included, when using the 2016 three year average median level of assessment for McHenry County of 33.29% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In response to the appeal, the board of review submitted a memo from the township assessor. The assessor argued appellant's comparables #1, #2 and #3 sold in 2013 or 2014 and are too old to consider for 2016. The board of review noted that based upon the comparable sales gathered by the township assessor, the subject property is under-assessed.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on three comparable sales of split-level, bi-level and raised ranch style dwellings of frame exterior construction ranging in size from 1,080 to 1,430 square feet of above grade living area. The properties were built from 1995 to 2003. Each comparable has a lower level that is partially finished, central air conditioning and a two-car garage. Two comparables each have one fireplace. The comparables sold from January 2016 to April 2017 for prices ranging from \$150,000 to \$199,900 or from \$135.87 to \$156.48 per square foot of above grade living area, including land.

While the board of review noted the subject appeared to be under-valued, the board of review did not request a change in the subject's assessment.

## **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The parties provided fourteen comparable sales to support their respective positions before the Property Tax Appeal Board. Little weight shall be given to the appellant's evidence as it contained no substantive descriptive information about the dwellings to allow the Property Tax Appeal Board to conduct a meaningful comparative analysis of the comparable sales as compared to the subject property. Additionally, six comparables are significantly older in age when compared to the subject and six comparables sold in 2013 and 2014, not as proximate in time to the assessment date at issue as other sales in the record. The Board also gave less weight to the board of review comparable sale #3 which sold 16 months after the January 1, 2016 assessment.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the board of review comparable sales #1 and #2. Both comparables are similar to the subject in dwelling size, age and features. These comparables sold January and February 2016 for prices of \$150,000 and \$169,000 or \$135.87 and \$156.48 per square foot of above grade living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$134,205 or \$108.23 per square foot of above grade living area, including land, which falls below the best comparable sales in this record both on overall value and a price per square foot basis. Based on this record a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

said office.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

Chairn	man
21. Fen	al R
Member	Member
Sobert Stoffen	Dan De Kinie
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	
CERTIFICA	TION
As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board a hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and con	=

Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this

Date: February 18, 2020

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

Mano Illorios

#### **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

# PARTIES OF RECORD

# **AGENCY**

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

# **APPELLANT**

AMH 2014 2 & Borrower LLC, by attorney: Michael R. Davies Ryan Law LLP 311 South Wacker Drive Mailbox #29 Chicago, IL 60606

# **COUNTY**

McHenry County Board of Review McHenry County Government Center 2200 N. Seminary Ave. Woodstock, IL 60098