

### FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT:	Jesus Zaragoza
DOCKET NO.:	16-04449.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.:	08-08-303-008

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Jesus Zaragoza, the appellant; and the Lake County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds <u>No Change</u> in the assessment of the property as established by the Lake County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND:	\$4,848
IMPR.:	\$15,929
TOTAL:	\$20,777

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

#### **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Lake County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

### **Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a one-story dwelling of wood siding exterior construction with 864 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 1955. Features of the home include a full unfinished basement and a 484 square foot garage. The property has a 5,859 square foot site and is located in Waukegan, Waukegan Township, Lake County.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted information on six comparable sales located between .74 of a mile and 4.91 miles from the subject property, one of which is located in the same neighborhood code as the subject as assigned by the township assessor. The comparables have sites ranging in size from 5,518 to 9,492 square feet of land area. The comparables were improved with one-story dwellings of brick, aluminum or wood siding exterior construction ranging in size from 864 to 988 square feet of living area. The dwellings were built from 1954 to 1969. One comparable features a crawl space foundation, five comparables have unfinished basements and four

comparables have garages ranging in size from 352 to 576 square feet of building area. The comparables sold from January to December 2016 for prices ranging from \$25,000 to \$39,900 or from \$25.51 to \$40.92 per square foot of living area, including land. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$20,777. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$62,657 or \$72.52 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2016 three-year average median level of assessment for Lake County of 33.16% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on four comparable sales located in the same neighborhood code as the subject property as assigned by the township assessor and within .137 of a mile of the subject. The comparables have sites ranging in size from 6,038 to 6,256 square feet of land area. The comparables were improved with one-story dwellings of wood siding exterior construction ranging in size from 768 to 912 square feet of living area. The dwellings were each built in 1955 and feature unfinished basements. In addition, three comparables have central air conditioning and each comparable has a garage ranging in size from 352 to 720 square feet of building area. The comparables sold from July 2014 to April 2016 for prices ranging from \$83,000 to \$99,000 or from \$103.01 to \$108.55 per square foot of living area, including land. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

In rebuttal, the appellant disagreed with the comparable sales evidence submitted by the board of review and submitted a grid analysis containing six comparable sales, five of which were not previously submitted as evidence.

# **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

As an initial matter regarding the appellant's rebuttal evidence, the board finds the rebuttal evidence contained new comparable properties not previously submitted by the appellant. Pursuant to the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board, rebuttal evidence is restricted to that evidence to explain, repel, counteract or disprove facts given in evidence by an adverse party. (86 Ill. Admin. Code, Sec. 1910.66(a)). Moreover, rebuttal evidence shall not consist of new evidence such as an appraisal or **newly discovered comparable properties**. (86 Ill. Admin. Code, Sec. 1910.66(c)). In light of these rules, the Property Tax Appeal Board shall not consider the five additional comparables submitted by the appellant in conjunction with their rebuttal argument.

The parties submitted ten comparable sales for the Board's consideration. The Board gave less weight to comparables #1 through #3, #5 and #6 that were submitted by the appellant because they are located too distant from the subject being over 2.64 miles away and outside of the subject's neighborhood code. The Board also finds that board of review comparables #1, #2 and #3 sold in 2014 which are dated and less likely to be indicative of the subject's market value as of the January 1, 2016 assessment date.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the appellant's comparable sale #4 and board of review comparable sale #4. These two comparables sold more proximate in time to the assessment date at issue and were similar to the subject in location, dwelling size, design, age and features. These comparables sold in April and December 2016 for prices of \$35,000 and \$99,000 or for \$40.51 and \$108.55 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$62,657 or \$72.52 per square foot of living area, including land, which is supported by the most similar comparable sales in this record. After considering adjustments to the comparable sales for differences when compared to the subject, the Board finds the estimated market value as reflected by the assessment is supported and no reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

	Chairman
22. Fer	C R
Member	Member
sover Staffer	Dan Dikini
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	

# <u>CERTIFICATION</u>

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:

January 21, 2020

Mano Morios

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

### **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND</u> <u>EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

### PARTIES OF RECORD

### AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

### APPELLANT

Jesus Zaragoza 2107 Delaware Rd Waukegan, IL 60087

### COUNTY

Lake County Board of Review Lake County Courthouse 18 North County Street, 7th Floor Waukegan, IL 60085