

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Ravi Rajagopalan DOCKET NO.: 16-04011.001-R-1 PARCEL NO.: 11-16-300-010

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Ravi Rajagopalan, the appellant, by attorney Andrew J. Rukavina, of The Tax Appeal Company in Mundelein; and the Lake County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Lake** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$66,197 **IMPR.:** \$218,098 **TOTAL:** \$284,295

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Lake County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a two-story dwelling of wood exterior construction with 2,988 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 2014. Features of the home include a full finished basement, central air conditioning, two fireplaces and a 572-square foot attached garage. The property has a 16,383-square foot site and is located in Libertyville, Libertyville Township, Lake County.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted an appraisal estimating the subject property had a market value of \$805,000 as of January 1, 2016. The appraisal was prepared by Steven L. Smith, a certified residential real estate appraiser. In estimating the market value of the subject property, the appraiser developed the sales comparison approach to value.

Under the sales comparison approach, the appraiser analyzed three comparable sales located from .06 to .36 of a mile from the subject property. The comparables consist of two-story dwellings that range in age from 10 to 91 years old. The dwellings had features with varying degrees of similarity when compared to the subject. The dwellings range in size from 3,004 to 3,412 square feet of living area and are situated on sites that range in size from 7,000 to 13,374 square feet of land area. The comparables sold from May 2015 to February 2016 for prices ranging from \$745,000 to \$849,000 or from \$234.47 to \$276.55 per square foot of living area including land. The appraiser made adjustments to each comparable for differences from the subject property to arrive at adjusted prices ranging from \$799,560 to \$821,000. The appellant requested the total assessment be reduced to \$268,306 which would reflect the appraised value.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the subject's final assessment of \$284,295. The subject's assessment reflects an estimated market value of \$857,343 or \$286.93 per square foot of living area including land when applying Lake County's 2016 three-year average median level of assessment of 33.16% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(c)(1).

In support of the subject's assessment, the board of review submitted information on three comparable sales located within .39 of a mile from the subject property. The comparables consist of one, 2.75 story dwelling and two, 2.0-story dwellings that were built from 2002 to 2012. The dwellings had features with varying degrees of similarity when compared to the subject. The dwellings range in size from 2,419 to 3,541 square feet of living area and are situated on sites that range in size from 2,744 to 7,000 square feet of land area. The comparables sold from June 2016 to March 2017 for prices ranging from \$820,000 to \$893,000 or from \$240.05 to \$369.16 per square foot of living area including land. The board of review included a 2014 Multiple Listing Service (MLS) sheet for the subject property. The MLS listing for the subject property disclosed it sold in September 2014 for a price of \$1,039,988. Included in the submission is the Lake County Property Detail Report.

The board of review submission also included a memo asserting that the appraisal's adjustments for age was too conservative. Furthermore, the board of review included a PTAX-203, Real Estate Transfer Declaration revealing that the subject site sold in September 2013 for a price of \$375,000. In January 2014, a new home permit was secured for a price of \$573,688. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

In written rebuttal, counsel for the appellant critiqued the board of review's submission. Included in the submission was an area map which indicated the location of the appellant's appraisal comparable sales and the board of review comparable sales.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The record contains an appraisal submitted by the appellant and information on three comparable sales provided by the board of review. The Board gave little weight to the appraisal submitted by the appellant. The Board finds the adjustment amount applied to the comparables for land are not supported with credible market value evidence. The subject site sold in September 2013 for a price of \$375,000 or \$22.89 per square foot of land area. The land adjustment for the appraisal comparables are \$4.99 or \$5.00 per square foot of land area. The appraisal contains no land sales to support the adjustment for land, therefore, the Board gives little weight to the appraiser's estimated value and adjustment, and the Board will consider the raw sales data for the comparables contain in this record.

The Board gave less weight to the appellant's appraisal comparable sale #3 due to its older age when compared to the subject property. The Board also gave little weight to the board of review's comparable #2 due to its dissimilar dwelling design when compared to the subject property. The Board finds the appellant's appraisal comparable sales #1 and #2 and board of review's comparable sales #1 and #3 are more similar to the subject in location, age, dwelling size, design and features. They sold from May 2015 to December 2016 for prices ranging from \$800,000 to \$893,000 or from \$234.47 to \$369.16 per square foot of living area including land. The subject's assessment reflects an estimated market value of \$857,343 or \$286.93 per square foot of living area including land, which falls within the range established by the most similar comparable sales contained in the record. The Board further finds the subject's sale in September 2014 for a price of \$1,039,988 further undermines the appellant's overvaluation argument. Based on this evidence the Board finds the subject is not overvalued and a reduction in the assessment is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

Mauro Illorios	
	Chairman
21. Fe-	R
Member	Member
assert Stoffen	Dan De Kinin
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: October 16, 2018

Star Mulynn

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Ravi Rajagopalan, by attorney: Andrew J. Rukavina The Tax Appeal Company 28643 North Sky Crest Drive Mundelein, IL 60060

COUNTY

Lake County Board of Review 18 North County Street 7th Floor Waukegan, IL 60085