



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Shelley Auble
DOCKET NO.: 16-03464.001-C-1
PARCEL NO.: 05-03-300-224

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Shelley Auble, the appellant, by attorney Ronald Kingsley, of Lake County Real Estate Tax Appeal, LLC in Lake Forest, and the Lake County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds **No Change** in the assessment of the property as established by the **Lake** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$ 45,763
IMPR.: \$242,172
TOTAL: \$287,935

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Lake County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a 2.5-story, 15-unit apartment building of brick construction with 17,280 square feet of building area. The building was constructed in 1974 and each apartment unit consists of two bedrooms and one bathroom. The property has a 37,897 square foot site and is located in Fox Lake, Grant Township, Lake County.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted information on three comparable sales of apartment buildings located in Grayslake or Round Lake Beach. The buildings contain four, ten or twelve apartments each. The comparable parcels range in size from 15,132 to 21,540 square feet of land area. The buildings range in size from 8,000 to 12,052 square feet of building area. The properties sold between October 2014 and May 2016 for prices ranging from \$294,000 to \$600,000 or from

\$41,675 to \$73,500 per apartment unit or from \$36.75 to \$54.41 per square foot of building area, including land.

Based on this evidence, the appellant requested application of the median sales price of \$49.78 per square foot of building area, including land, to the subject property and argued that comparable #2 was most similar to the subject in size.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$287,935. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$868,320 or \$57,888 per apartment unit or \$50.25 per square foot of building area, land included, when using the 2016 three year average median level of assessment for Lake County of 33.16% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In response to the appellant's evidence, the board of review noted that appellant's comparable #1 is only a four unit building with a basement, which differs from the subject property. While comparable #2 has ten units, the board of review noted this property has only four two-bedroom units and six one-bedroom units which differ from the subject. Appellant's comparable #3 was listed as a bank owned property that needed rehab work and the property has eleven one-bedroom units and a studio unit which differs from the subject's all two-bedroom use.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on six comparable sales, three of which are located in the immediate Fox Lake/Ingleside area. The parcels range in size from 26,724 to 53,997 square feet of land area. The buildings were built between 1965 and 1995 and have from 12 to 24 apartment units; comparable #4 has only one-bedroom units whereas the remaining comparables each have a majority of two-bedroom units. The comparables range in size from 9,648 to 23,106 square feet of building area. The properties sold from August 2014 to October 2017 for prices ranging from \$600,000 to \$1,475,000 or from \$50,000 to \$68,333 per apartment unit or for \$51.55 to \$91.00 per square foot of building area, including land.

The board of review argued that these sales reflect a median price of \$60,503 per apartment unit. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The parties submitted a total of nine suggested comparable apartment buildings to support their respective positions before the Property Tax Appeal Board. The Board has given reduced weight to the appellant's comparables #1 and #3 along with board of review comparable #4 as each of these comparables either have many fewer apartment units than the subject or feature primarily one-bedroom units as compared to the subject's two-bedroom use.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be appellant's comparable sale #2 and board of review comparable sales #1, #2, #3, #5 and #6. These most similar comparables sold between August 2014 and June 2017 for prices ranging from \$600,000 to \$1,420,000 or from \$50,000 to \$68,333 per apartment unit or from \$49.78 to \$76.75 per square foot of building area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$868,320 or \$57,888 per apartment unit or \$50.25 per square foot of building area, including land, which is within the range established by the best comparable sales in this record. After considering adjustments and the differences in the best comparables when compared to the subject property, the Board finds a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

Chairman



Member

Member



Member

Member

DISSENTING: _____

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: December 23, 2019



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois
Property Tax Appeal Board
William G. Stratton Building, Room 402
401 South Spring Street
Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Shelley Auble, by attorney:
Ronald Kingsley
Lake County Real Estate Tax Appeal, LLC
13975 W. Polo Trail Drive
#201
Lake Forest, IL 60045

COUNTY

Lake County Board of Review
Lake County Courthouse
18 North County Street, 7th Floor
Waukegan, IL 60085