

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Alpesh Shah
DOCKET NO.: 16-03190.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 15-06-417-004

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Alpesh Shah, the appellant, by attorney Ronald Kingsley, of Lake County Real Estate Tax Appeal, LLC in Lake Forest; and the Lake County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Lake** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$20,588 IMPR.: \$98,075 TOTAL: \$118,663

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Lake County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a one-story dwelling of frame exterior construction with 1,942 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 1991. Features of the home include a full basement with finished area, central air conditioning, a fireplace and a 400 square foot attached garage. The property has a 7,524 square foot site and is located in Vernon Hills, Vernon Township, Lake County.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted information on three comparable sales located from .27 to .49 of a mile from the subject property. The comparables are described as one-story dwellings of frame exterior construction that have either 1,942 or 2,078 square feet of living area. The dwellings were constructed in 1989. The comparables have basements, two of which have finished areas. Additional features include central air conditioning; two comparables have fireplaces and each

comparable has an attached garage with 400 square feet of building area. The comparables have sites ranging in size from 7,508 to 14,281 square feet of land area. The comparables sold from May 2014 to April 2016 for prices ranging from \$315,000 to \$394,450 or from \$162.20 to \$189.82 per square foot of living area including land.

The appellant also submitted a Multiple Listing Service (MLS) listing sheet indicating that appellant's comparable #2 had a partially finished basement. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's total assessment to \$114,567 which would reflect a market value of approximately \$343,701 or \$176.98 per square foot of living area, including land.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$118,663. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$357,850 or \$184.27 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2016 three year average median level of assessment for Lake County of 33.16% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In support of the subject's assessment, the board of review submitted information on four comparable sales, three of which were used by the appellant. The comparables are located from .267 to .5 of a mile from the subject property. The comparables are improved with one-story dwellings of frame exterior construction that range in size from 1,942 to 2,088 square feet of living area. The dwellings were constructed in 1989. The comparables have basements, two of which have finished areas. Additional features include central air conditioning, three comparables have fireplaces and each comparable has an attached garage with 400 square feet of building area. The comparables have sites ranging in size from 7,508 to 14,281 square feet of land area. The comparables sold from May 2014 to April 2017 for prices ranging from \$315,000 to \$394,450 or from \$162.20 to \$189.82 per square foot of living area, including land. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested that the subject property's assessment be confirmed.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The Board finds the parties submitted seven suggested comparable sales for consideration, with three common properties submitted by both parties. The Board gave less weight to the appellant's comparable #3/board of review comparable #1 due to the sale occurring in May 2014 which is dated and less indicative of market value as of the January 1, 2016, assessment date. The Board also gave less weight to board of review comparable #3 based on sale occurring in April of 2017 which is 16 months after the January 1, 2016 assessment date and less indicative of market value.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be appellant's comparables #1/board of review comparable #2 and appellant's comparable #2/board of review comparable #4. The Board finds these comparables are most similar to the subject in location, site size, design, age, dwelling size, and/or features. The comparables sold on July 2015 and April 2016 for prices of \$315,000 and \$389,000 or for \$162.20 and \$187.20 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$357,850 or \$184.27 per square foot of living area, including land which falls between the most similar comparable sales in this record. After considering adjustments to the comparables for differences, when compared to the subject, the Board finds the subject's estimated market value as reflected by its assessment is supported. Based on this record the Board finds the appellant did not demonstrate by a preponderance of the evidence that the subject was overvalued and no reduction in the subject's assessment is justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

Maus Illorias	
	Chairman
	CAR
Member	Member
Sobrit Stoffen	Dan De Kinin
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: January 15, 2019

Star M Wagner

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Alpesh Shah, by attorney: Ronald Kingsley Lake County Real Estate Tax Appeal, LLC 13975 W. Polo Trail Drive #201 Lake Forest, IL 60045

COUNTY

Lake County Board of Review 18 North County Street 7th Floor Waukegan, IL 60085