

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT:	AMH 20151 Borrower LLC
DOCKET NO.:	16-02954.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.:	04-18-304-007

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are AMH 20151 Borrower LLC, the appellant, by Michael R. Davies, of the Law Offices of Michael R. Davies, Ltd. in Oak Lawn; and the Lake County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds <u>No Change</u> in the assessment of the property as established by the Lake County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND:	\$6,136
IMPR.:	\$38,395
TOTAL:	\$44,531

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

### **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Lake County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

### **Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a two-story single-family dwelling of frame exterior construction that has 1,656-square feet living area. The dwelling was constructed in 1997. Features include a full unfinished basement, central air conditioning, a fireplace, and a 400-square foot garage. The subject property has a 9,975-square foot site and is located in Zion Township, Lake County.

The appellant submitted evidence before the Property Tax Appeal Board claiming overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of the overvaluation claim, the appellant submitted limited descriptive information for eight comparable sales that were reported to be located from 0.11 to 0.52 of a mile from the subject.<sup>1</sup> The comparables were reported to consist of one-story to two-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The Board requested the appellant to complete the grid analysis in Section V of the appeal petition. The appellant failed to comply with the Board's request.

story dwellings built from 1962 to 2005 and reported to have three or four bedrooms and one to three bathrooms. The appellant failed to disclose the comparables' exterior construction, foundation type, design or features such as central air conditioning, fireplaces and/or garages. The dwellings were reported to range in size from 1,472 to 1,892 square feet of living area and have sites ranging in size from 7,841 to 43,560 square feet of land area. The comparables sold from May 2013 to December 2015 for prices ranging from \$97,000 to \$129,000 or from \$61.11 to \$84.24 per square foot of living area including land. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$44,531. The subject's assessment reflects an estimated market value of \$134,291 or \$81.09 per square foot of living area including land when applying the 2016 three-year average median level of assessment for Lake County of 33.16%.

In support of the subject's assessment, the board of review submitted information on four comparable sales located from 0.165 to 0.303 of a mile from the subject. The comparables consist of one, one-story dwelling and three, two-story dwellings of frame exterior construction built from 1995 to 2003. Each comparable has a full unfinished basement and central air conditioning; two comparables each have a fireplace; and each comparable has a garage ranging in size from 400 to 440 square feet of building area. The dwellings range in size from 1,656 to 1,809 square feet of living area and are situated on sites containing from 10,003 to 10,495 square feet of land area. The comparables sold from July 2014 to November 2016 for prices ranging from \$150,000 to \$186,000 or from \$85.68 to \$104.26 per square foot of living area including land. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

# **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and no reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The record contains twelve comparable sales for the Board's consideration. The Board gave less weight to the comparables submitted by the appellant as four of those comparables sold from 2013 to 2014, which sales are dated and less indicative of market value as of the subject's January 1, 2016 assessment date. Moreover, the appellant's attorney failed to provide any specifics regarding the comparables' story height, exterior construction, foundation type, design or features such as central air conditioning, fireplaces and/or garages for a comparative analysis, which further detracts from the weight of the evidence. The Board gave less weight board of review comparable #1 which sold in July 2014, as said sale is dated and less indicative of market value as of the subject's January 1, 2016 assessment date. The Board finds that the board of review comparables #2, #3 and #4 sold more proximate in time to the subject's assessment date and are similar to the subject in location, land area, design, age, dwelling size and features. They sold from March 2015 to November 2016 for prices ranging from \$155,000 to \$186,000 or from

\$85.68 to \$104.26 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects an estimated market value of \$134,291 or \$81.09 per square foot of living area, including land, which falls below the range established by the most similar comparable sales contained in the record. After considering any adjustments to the comparables when compared the subject, the Board finds the subject's estimated market value as reflected by its assessment is justified and no reduction is warranted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

Mano Moino Chairman Member Member Member Member DISSENTING:

### CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:

September 18, 2018

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

#### **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND</u> <u>EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

# PARTIES OF RECORD

# AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

### APPELLANT

AMH 20151 Borrower LLC, by attorney: Michael R. Davies Law Offices of Michael R. Davies, Ltd. 5533 West 109th Street, Unit 219 Oak Lawn, IL 60453

# COUNTY

Lake County Board of Review 18 North County Street 7th Floor Waukegan, IL 60085